

**EFFECT OF SOME NON-CHEMICAL, SEED AND
FOLIAGE APPLICATIONS ON COTTON
DAMPING OFF DISEASE INCIDENCE
AND YIELD CHARACTERISTICS**

Maisa, L. Abd El Moinem

**Central Lab. of Organic Agriculture, Agricultural
Research Center, Giza, Egypt.**

Accepted 25 / 9 / 2005

ABSTRACT: Four different beneficial microorganisms namely (*Trichoderma harzianum*, *Bacillus subtilis*, *Pseudomonas fluorescens* and mixture of mycorrhizal fungi *Glomus etunicatum*, *G. intraradices*, *G. fasciculatum*), were used as seed treatment to study their effects on cotton seedlings damping off disease incidence in comparison with the effect of recommended dose of fungicide monocirine. These treatments were implemented under greenhouse (artificial heavily infested soil) and field (naturally infested soil) conditions.

Foliage treatments were only applied under field conditions to study their effects on quality and seed oil content. Foliage field applications included, *Trichoderma harzianum* and *Bacillus subtilis*, humic acid, and calcium chloride preparation. Data of greenhouse show that soaking cotton seeds for 48 h in *T. harzianum* and *B. subtilis* preparations led to best disease control and highest number of survived plants, compare with control treatment. Data also showed that cotton plant protection was positively correlated with concentration of bioagents and length of soaking period.

Results obtained from field experiments were in harmony with those obtained from greenhouse ones regarding damping off percentage, and survived plants. Plant heights were also determined in survived plants after one month in different treatments. Data obtained show that *B. subtilis* followed *T. harzianum* if compared with fungicide or control ones. Regarding effect of foliage treatment on fiber quality and seed oil content, obtained data show that

different treatments were varied in their effects on different parameters, color, fiber length, fiber strength and elongation percentage, fiber fineness and maturity leaf product and percentage of seed oil contents. *T. harzianum* showed the best results on the previously measured parameters. No significant effect on color yellowness was obtained. *B. subtilis* occupied the second rank after *T. harzianum* where it improved leaf product and fiber length. Foliage treatment with CaCl_2 led to improvement in fiber fineness and maturity, Foliage treatment with humic acid 45 % at 100 ml / 20 l. Water show no significant differences in all measured parameters compared with control one.

Key words: Biological control, Damping off, cotton yield characteristics, *Trichoderma harzianum*, *Bacillus subtilis*, *Pseudomonas fluorescens*, mycorrhizae.

INTRODUCTION

Seedling diseases of cotton are among the most important diseases that limit cotton lint and seed production. In 2001 the estimated loss in bales of cotton due to seedling diseases was 2.34% or approximately \$ 169, 820, 640 (Blasingame and Mukund 2001). Moreover, the widespread use of the chemicals has become a subject of public concern and scrutiny mainly due to their potential harmful effect on non-target organisms, development of resistant races of pathogens and possible carcinogenicity of some chemicals. There is need to examine the potential for non chemical approaches to disease management (Misaghi *et al.*, 1998.)

Trichoderma spp. long have been known for their abilities to control plant pathogenic fungi mechanisms primarily have included direct effects upon target fungi via competition, mycoparasitism and antibiosis (Abd-El Moity 1981, Chet 1987). In addition, these fungi have been shown to directly increase plant growth (Chang *et al.*, 1986). They also have abilities to solubilize plant nutrients and to increase plant nutrient uptake (Lindsey and Baker 1967, Altomare *et al.*, 1999, Yedidia *et al.*, 2001 and Harman *et al.*, 2004).

Treated cotton seedlings with effective biocontrol strains of *T. virens* have higher levels of defense-related compounds such as

terpenoids and higher peroxides activity in the roots than seedlings treated with ineffective isolates (Howell *et al.* 2000). Effective biocontrol strain of *Trichoderma virens* can induce the production of defense-related compounds in the roots of cotton. Ineffective strains do not induce these compounds to significant levels. This elicitation was found to be heat stable, in soluble chloroform. (Hanson and Howell, 2004). Many plant species stimulate and support populations of rhizosphere bacteria (*Rhizobacteria*) as a first line of defense against soil borne plant pathogens (Cook *et al.*, 1995). Several *Bacillus spp.* including *B. subtilis* are antagonistic to plant pathogenic fungi and bacteria. *Bacillus spp.* produced at least 66 different antibiotic compounds (Ferreira *et al.*, 1991). Several strains of *B. subtilis* were used to suppress take all disease and *Rhizoctonia* root rot on wheat seedling and promote wheat seedling growth (Ryder *et al.*, 1999). Phloroglucinols (PG) are phenolic, secondary metabolites produced by plants, algae and bacteria (Bangera and Thomashow, 1996, 1999, Ishigureo *et al.*, 1998 and Bokesch *et al.*, 1999).

More than 60 PG derivatives have been described and were

reported to have antiviral, antimicrobial, insect and mammal antifeedant, phytotoxic, antioxidant, cytotoxic, antitumor plant growth regulating activities (Yajima and Munakata. 1979, Arisawa. *et al.*, 1990, Toda *et al.*, 1990, Keel *et al.*, 1992, Cornion *et al.*, 1997, Lawler *et al.*, 1999, Te-Chato. and Lim 1999., Debabrata and Naik 2000 and Ito *et al.*, 2000)

Strains of fluorescent *Pseudomonas* that produce the antibiotic 2, 4 diacetylphoroglucinol (2.4 DAPG) are among the most effective rhizobacteria controlling diseases caused by soil borne pathogens (Landa *et al.*, 2003 and De Suza *et al.*, 2003).

Roots of plants, support the growth of complex microorganisms that in concert can have a profound effect on the life cycle and survival of the plant. Among these organisms arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi (AMF) that are known to improve the nutritional status of their host (Smith and Read, 1997) and provoke alternations in the hosts physiology (Linderman, 1992) and exudation from roots (Schwab *et al.*, 1984 and Bansal and Mukerji, 1994.). The mode of action of (AMF) include in direct interaction such as competition between the symbiont and pathogen for

infection sites, (Muchovej *et al.*, 1991) or indirect interactions such as altera of root exudation and / or of the mycorrhizosphere microbial community (Hassan *et al.*, 1997. and Filion *et al.*, 2003).

The present work was carried out to study the role of biological control on damping off diseases in cotton plants compared with chemical control. In addition, the effect of spraying of some preparations on fiber quality and percentage of cotton seed oil, was also investigated.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Inoculum Preparation and Soil Greenhouse Infestation

a) Pathogenic fungi

Three fungi (*Sclerotium rolfii* Sacc., *Rhizoctonia solani* and *Fusarium solani*) were pathogenic to cotton seeds which kindly obtained from Integrated Control Research Dep., Plant Pathology Institute, ARC, Giza. Pathogenic fungi were prepared using the method mentioned by Abd-El Moity 1985 as follows: *Sclerotium rolfii* isolate was inoculated in Petri dishes containing PDA medium then incubated at 27°C. After 15 days sclerotia were harvested and added to soil at the rate of 100 Sclerotia

of *S. rolfii* /kg soil. Bottles 600 ml in capacity, each contained 100 g of modified sand corn meal media (25 g corn + 7 kg sand + 1 litre of peptone solution) were inoculated with equal disks 0.5 cm in diameter of *Rhizoctonia solani* from cultures three days old. Inoculated bottles were then incubated at 20°C. After 30 days. Inoculum of *R.solani* was added to soil at the rate of 10 g of sand corn meal / kg of soil and each gram contains (5×10^6 cfu). Isolate of *Fusarium solani* was grown in bottle 600 ml contained 100 ml Richard slants medium and incubated at 25°C. After 2 weeks, 50 ml sterilized distilled water were added to each flask on the medium surface and rubbed gently using small brush to prepare spore suspension. The number of conidia were determined using haemocytometer slide and adjusted to be contain approximately 7×10^8 conidia / ml (12 ml / kg soil).

b) Antagonistic microorganisms

Different biocontrol agents (*Trichoderma harzianum*, *Bacillus subtilis*, *Pseudomonas fluorescens*) were obtained kindly from Integrated Control Research Dep., Plant Pathology Institute, ARC, Giza, and mixture of (mycorrhizal fungi *Glomus*

etunicatum, *Glomus intraradices* and *Glomus fasciculatum*) this was commercial known "Triton" were used in these studies. *Trichoderma harzianum* was grown on liquid gliotoxin fermented medium (G. F. M.) developed by Brain and Hemming (1945) and composed of Dextrose 25.0 g; Ammonium tartarate 2.0 g; MgSO₄ 1.0 g; KH₂PO₄; FeSO₄ 0.01 g and distilled water 1000.0 ml under complete darkness just to stimulate toxin production (Abd-El Moity and Shatla 1981) for 9 days. The suspension of *T. harzianum* was prepared by adjusting number of *Trichoderma* propagules in the suspension to be 30×10^6 / ml. *B. subtilis* and *Ps. fluorescens* were grown on nutrient glucose broth (NGB) prepared by Dowson (1957) and composed of (beef extract 3.0 g; peptone 5.0 g; Glucose 10.0 g and distilled water 1000.0 ml.) for 48 h. The bacterial suspension was also adjusted to be contain 30×10^6 cfu./ml. Mixture of mycorrhizal fungi were used as a commercial product known as "Triton".

Greenhouse Experiments

For all greenhouse experiments unless otherwise mentioned, new pots 20 cm in diam., were used. Pots were filled with infested soil with (*Sclerotium rolfsii*, *Rhizoctonia solani* and *Fusarium*

solani at the rate of the previously mentioned (a. Pathogenic fungi) (1.7 kg / pot.) Ten cotton seeds of the variety Giza 83 were sown in each pot and five replicates were used for each treatment. Soil infested with pathogens was used as control treatment.

1. Evaluation of different biocontrol agents against the pathogens

In this experiment the four antagonists were used as suspensions at the rate of 20 ml or 20g (in mycorrhiza treatment)/ litre. The seeds were soaked for 24 h. On the other hand, seed treated with moncerin (as fungicide) at the rate of 1.5 g / kg seed, served as another control. Cotton seeds were then sown. Disease incidence was determined weekly for one month.

Percentage of efficacy was calculated using the next formula:-

$$A = 100 - \left[\frac{F1}{F2} \times 100 \right]$$

A: denotes % of efficacy

F1: denotes % of infected plants in treatment

F2: denotes % of infected plants in control

2. Effect of soaking time in different suspension of bioagents on the efficacy of biocontrolling damping off disease

Different antagonists (*Trichoderma harzianum*, *Bacillus subtilis*, *Pseudomonas fluorescens* and mixture of mycorrhizal fungi *Glomus etunicatum*, *Glomus intraradices* and *Glomus fasciculatum*) were used as which different concentrations mentioned before in (b. Antagonistic microorganisms). Seeds were soaked at different periods, 24 and 48 h. in different bioagents, to study the effect of time of application on the efficacy of the treatment.

3. Effect of different concentrations of bioagents in controlling damping off diseases

Different bioagents were used as suspensions using different concentrations at the rate of (20, 10, 5 ml or g / l water). Seeds were soaked at different bioagents at 24 h. Treated seeds were sown in infested soil, to study their efficacy of the treatment against pathogenic fungi.

Field Experiments:

This study was carried out in two seasons (2002 and 2003) in one feddan area at Manshia Dakem in Sanoras El-Fayium governorate. The experiment was divided into two plots. The first plot was used to study biocontrolling soil borne fungi. Four different biocontrol

agents were used as mentioned before in (b) Antagonistic microorganisms. These bioagents were applied in three sub plots.

I- A- To evaluate the effect of biocontrol agents against soil borne pathogens.

I- B- To study the effect of soaking time (24 and 48h) with different suspensions of bioagents on the efficacy of biocontrolling damping off disease.

I- C- To study the effect of different concentrations of bioagents in controlling damping off disease.

The second plot was designed to study the effect of spraying with some materials as (calcium chloride, humic acid, *B. subtilis* and *T. harzianum* preparations) on the characteristic of the cotton fiber and percent of the oil in seed cotton.

I. Biocontrol of soil borne fungi under field conditions

I-A. Evaluation of different biocontrol agents against soil borne pathogens

In this study the four antagonists were used as suspension treatment at the rate of 20 ml or 20 g (in mycorrhiza treatment) / litre. The seeds were

soaked at 24 h, and then cotton seeds were sown. Cotton seeds were sown without any treatment to serve as the first control. Seeds were treated with moncerin as fungicide at the rate of 1.5 g / kg seeds, this treatment served as a second control. Disease incidence was determined weekly for one month. Plant heights at 30 days old, were also measured.

Treatments were carried out in complete randomized plots design.

I-B. Effect of soaking time (24 and 48 h) with different suspensions of bioagents on the efficacy of biocontrolling damping off disease

Different bioagents were used as suspension. Seeds were soaked at different periods for 24 and 48 h. to study the suitable time of the application. Disease incidence and plant heights were determined as mentioned before.

I-C. Effect of different concentrations of bioagents in controlling damping off disease

Different antagonists were used as suspension with different concentrations at the rate of (20, 10, 5 ml or g / litre) to study the effect of these concentrations on the efficacy of the treatments

against pathogenic fungi under natural infection in open field.

Statistical analysis was carried out in all the above treatments according to (Duncan 1954 and Gomez and Gomez 1984).

II. Effect of different preparations on field quality of the cotton plants

In this study *T. harzianum* and *B. subtilis* were used as suspension at the rate of litre/200 litre water. On the other hand, calcium chloride and humic acid 4% at the rate of 100 ml/20 litre water, were used. All previous preparations were sprayed every 2 weeks at four times during the season. All fiber quality properties of row cotton were measured on the VHI instrument according to the standard test methods of the American Society for Testing and Materials ASTM (1984), in conformity with the following designations; fiber length, D-1440-67; fiber strength and elongation, D-1445-75 micronaire reading, D - 1448 - 59 and cotton color, D - 2253 - 66. Predicted yarn strength for the tested samples were computed on HVI - 900 B system, in accordance with data of fiber properties obtained for each sample.

Fiber properties were determined at the laboratories of The Cotton Technology Research Division Cotton Research Institute, Giza, Egypt under standard atmospheric conditions of $65 \pm 2\%$ relative humidity and $21 \pm 1^\circ$ C temperatures. (ASTM 1984).

B) Effect of different preparations on the oil percent of seeds

In this study *T. harzianum* and *Bacillus subtilis* were used at the rate of one litre / 200 litre water, calcium chloride and humic acid 45% at the rate of 100 ml / 20 litre water. All previous different materials were sprayed every 2 weeks four times during the season. Oil percent was determined according to the official method recommended by the American Oil Chemists Society, A. O. C. S. (1970).

Determination of oil percentage was carried at the Cotton Research Institute, ARC, Giza, Egypt.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

Effect of different bioagents and their reaction against soil-borne pathogens which caused damping off in cotton was carried out under greenhouse conditions.

Data presented in Table (1), showed that all tested bioagents and recommended chemical fungicide (moncerin) reduced significantly the disease incidence, if compared with control treatment.

T. harzianum was the most effective bioagent in decreasing the percentage of disease incidence (87.5% healthy survival and 81.48% of efficacy). *Bacillus subtilis*, *Pseudomonas fluorescens*, mycorrhizal fungi and Moncerin followed by *T. harzianum* in this respect. The percentages of healthy survived plants were 83.7, 65, 50 and 50%, respectively. These results indicated that different antagonists behaved differently under the same conditions. Treatment of *T. harzianum* or *B. subtilis* led to the best reduction in disease incidence. This reduction might be due to that either *Trichoderma spp.* or *Bacillus subtilis* produce antifungal antibiotic substances. *T. harzianum* produce gliotoxin, viridin (Abd-El Moity, 1981) while *B. subtilis* produces antifungal materials *subtilin* (Johanson *et al.*, 1960). These antifungal materials inhibit growth of pathogenic fungi, consequently they become more susceptible to the effect of other

microorganisms naturally exist in the soil (Hader and Gorodecki., 1991). *Ps. flourescens* occupied the third rank after *Trichoderma harzianum* and *Bacillus subtilis*. Effect of *Ps. flourescens* might be due to cleat available iron in the rhizosphere area. Under this iron starvation conditions, the pathogens cannot grow (Loper, 1988). Also *Ps. flourescens* acts through production of some antibiotic (Duffy and Defago., 1997 and Sharifi *et al.*, 1998). Arbuscular Mycorrhizal fungi (AMF) occupied the fourth rank after *T. harzianum*, *B. subtilis* and *Ps. flourescens*. The mode of action of (AMF) include direct interaction such as competition between the symbiont and pathogen for infection sites (Muchovej *et al.*, 1991) or indirect interactions such as alteration of

root exudation and/or of the mycorrhiza share in microbial community (Hassan *et al.*, 1997 and Filion *et al.*, 2003).

Effect of soaking time (24 and 48 h) at different suspensions of bioagents on the efficacy of controlling damping off disease of cotton plant was investigated under greenhouse conditions. Data obtained in Table (2) indicate that soaking in different antagonists at different periods (24 and 48 h) led to different results concerning biological control. Data obtained indicate that in most cases fungal antagonists gave the best result at 48 h of soaking where for bacterial antagonist was at 24 h. These results might be due to the fast multiplication and growth of bacteria compared with growth of fungi.

Table 1: Evaluation of using antagonistic microorganisms in controlling damping off disease of cotton plants, under greenhouse conditions

Different treatments	% of pre	% of post	% of survival plants	% of efficacy
<i>Trichoderma harzianum</i>	12.5	0	87.5	81.48
<i>Bacillus subtilis</i>	16.25	0	83.75	75.92
<i>Pseudomonas flourescens</i>	35	0	65	48.14
<i>Mycorrhiza</i> (Triton)	47.5	2.5	50	25.92
Moncerin	50	0	50	25.93
control	65	2.5	32.5	0.00
L.S. D. at 5 %	1.51	0.73	2.18	

Trichoderma sp. might also act through production of destructive enzymes *i. e.* chitinase (Bolar *et al.* 2000). Action of *B. subtilis* is due to production of number of antibiotic like substances as bacteriocin and subtilin (Farahat, 1998).

To demonstrate if there are negative or positive side effect for the treatments on plant health, cotton plant length was determined in all treatments as an indicator for plant health and physiological performance. Data in Table (4) show that different treatments were drastically varied in their effects on plant length. *B. subtilis* showed the highest length of treated plants being 62 cm if compared with control treatment (40cm). Monocerin treated plants also show stunting if compared with the plants treated with biological agents. This might be due to that chemical fungicide may has negative effect on plant cell while biological methods might have positive side effect as indicated by (Abd-El Moity, 1981) who mentioned that *T. harzianum* has stimulatory effect on plant growth. However, Grosch and Grote (1998) revealed that tomato fruit yield was significantly increased after application of *B. subtilis*

comparing with control treatment. Effect of *Bacillus subtilis* in controlling damping off disease, and increasing the length and yield is due to production of antibiotics (Iturina and increase Surfactin) (Asaka and Shoda 1996; Hwang *et al.* 1996 and Ryder *et al.* 1999.).

Pseudomonas fluorescens produces some antibiotic *i.e* pyrrolnitrin, pyoluterin and 2, 4 diacetyl ploroglucinol. These antibiotics, suppress damping off and led to an increase in the growth of plant (Sarniguet *et al.*, 1995). On the other hand, mycorrhiza might protect plants through providing the unavailable phosphorus to the growing cotton plants. Such results are in accordance with those obtained by (Galal and Ali, 2004).

Time of application of seed soaking (24 and 48 h) of the different suspension concentrations of biocontrol agents effect on the efficacy of controlling damping off disease of cotton plants under field conditions, was studied. Data presented in Table (5) show that all tested bioagents significantly reduced the disease incidence if compared with control treatment. It is clear that seed soaking in suspension of different antagonists for different periods (24 and 48 h) led to different results.

Table 2: Effect of soaking time (24 and 48h) in the different suspensions of bioagents on the efficacy of the biocontrolling of damping off disease of cotton plant under greenhouse conditions

Different treatments	Soaking time							
	24 h from seed soaking			48 h from seed soaking				
	% of pre	% of post	% of survival plants	% of efficacy	% of pre	% of post	% of survival plants	% of efficacy
<i>Trichoderma harzianum</i>	12.5	0	87.5	81.48	6.25	2.5	91.25	85.4
<i>Bacillus subtilis</i>	16.25	0	83.75	75.92	17.5	0	82.5	70.8
<i>Pseudomonas flourescens</i>	35	0	65	48.14	45	0	55	25
<i>Mycorrhiza</i> (Triton)	47.5	2.5	50	25.92	37.5	0	62.5	37.5
Control	65	2.5	32.5	0.00	60	0	40	0.00
L. S. D. at 5 %	2.04	0.18	2.3		1.48	0.08	2.19	

Data recorded in Table (3) show that adding different doses of bioagents led to different degrees of protection against soil-borne pathogens. Positive correlation was observed between doses of the antagonist and efficacy of the treatments. Higher values of different antagonists were obtained at their recommended doses comparing with their half ones (Abd-ElMoity *et al.*, 1990, Aly *et al.*, 1995, and Rodriguez and Cotes 1999).

These results can be explained in the light of data obtained by Wolk and Sorker (1994). They stated that the efficacy of antagonists depend on their capacity comparing with other microorganisms that occupied rhizosphere area.

Evaluation of used antagonistic microorganisms in controlling damping off disease of cotton plants under field condition revealed that all different bioagents and moncerin as a chemical fungicide significantly reduced the disease incidence compared with control treatment. Data obtained in Table (4) indicated that *T. harzianum* and *B. subtilis* were the most effective antagonists against soil-borne pathogens. This high potentiality in antagonism might be due to that *Trichoderma spp.* acts through different mechanisms including mycoparasitism (Abd-El Moity and Shatla 1981; and Benhamous and Chet 1993) also through production of anti-fungal substances (Hayes 1992).

Table 3: Effect of different concentrations of bioagents on controlling damping off of cotton plants, under greenhouse conditions

Different treatments	Different concentrations											
	*A				B				C			
	% of pre	% of post	% of survival plants	% of efficacy	% of pre	% of post	% of survival plants	% of efficacy	% of pre	% of post	% of survival plants	% of efficacy
<i>Trichoderma harzianum</i>	43.75	0	56.25	35	12.5	0	87.5	81.48	11.25	0	88.75	83.33
<i>Bacillus subtilis</i>	60	0	40	11.1	16.25	0	83.75	75.92	12.5	0	87.5	81.04
<i>Pseudomonas flourescens</i>	40	0	60	40	35	0	65	48.14	17.5	0	82.5	74.07
<i>Mycorrhiza (tri-ton)</i>	53.75	8.75	37.5	7.4	47.5	2.5	50	25.92	38.75	5	56.25	35.18
Control	65	2.5	32.5	0.0	65	2.5	32.5	0.00	65	2.5	32.5	0.0
LSD at 5 %	2.30	0.22	2.15		2.04	0.18	2.3		1.64	0.23	3.4	

*A: Half (R. D.) B: Recommended dose (R. D). C: Double (R. D.)

Table 4: Evaluation of different antagonistic microorganisms in controlling damping off disease of cotton plants under field conditions

Different treatments	% of pre	% of post	Plant heights at 30 days old	% of survived plants	% of efficacy
<i>Trichoderma harzianum</i>	26.7	0	60.3	73.3	55.9
<i>Bacillus subtilis</i>	26.7	0	62	73.3	55.5
<i>Pseudomonas flourescens</i>	40.0	0	56	60	33.3
<i>Mycorrhiza</i> (Triton)	33.3	0	50.6	66.6	44.5
Moncerin	26.7	0	43.6	73.3	55.5
control	60	0	40.6	40	0.00
L. S. D. at 5%	1.55	N. S	1.78	1.63	

In general fungal antagonist gave the best result of 48 h soaking while bacterial antagonist gave the best results of 24 h of seed soaking period. This might be due to that bacteria multiply faster and number of population increased in a very short time (Abd-El Moity *et al.*, 2003).

Data recorded in Table (6) show that different concentrations of bioagents and chemical fungicide led to different degrees of protection against soil-borne pathogens. Positive correlation was observed between level (concentration) of treatment and percentage of survived plants except for chemical fungicide which showed negative effect on plant parameters where it shows

stunting of treated plants if compared with control one. This might be due to that treatment with biopreparation at high level increased secondary metabolites (include antifungal, antibiotics, enzymes and growth regulators...) compared with another concentrations. (Aly *et al.*, 1995, Rodriguez and Cotes, 1999).

Data in Table (7) show the effect of different preparations on fiber quality of the cotton plants. Spraying plants with *T. harzianum* led to significant increase in the different parameters. This effect might be due to that *T. harzianum* produce some growth regulators or might affect through enzymes and / or antifungal substances (Padares *et al.*, 1992) or also stimulate some

Table 5: Effect of soaking time with different suspension concentrations of bioagents on the efficacy of biocontrolling dampingoff disease under field conditions

Different treatments	Time of treatment									
	24 h.					48 h.				
	% of pre	% of post	Length of plant	% of survival plants	% of efficacy	% of pre	% of post	Length of plant	% of survival plants	% of efficacy
<i>Trichoderma harzianum</i>	26.7	0	60.3	73.3	55.5	20	0	64.3	80	57.17
<i>Bacillus subtilis</i>	26.7	0	62	73.3	55.5	33.3	0	57.6	66.7	28.69
<i>Pseudomonas flourescens</i>	40	0	56	60	33.3	40	0	58	60	14.34
<i>Mycorrhiza (tri-ton)</i>	33.3	0	50.6	66.7	44.5	26.7	0	54.3	73.3	42.8
Control	60	0	40.6	40	0.00	46.7	0	50.6	53.3	0.00
LSD at 5 %	2.3	N. S	1.82	3.04		2.30	N. S	2.7	2.30	

Table 6: Effect of different concentrations of bioagents on controlling dampingoff of cotton plants under field conditions

Different treatments	Different concentrations														
	*A					B					C				
	% of pre	% of post	Length of plants	% of survival plants	% of efficacy	% of pre	% of post	Length of plants	% of survival plants	% of efficacy	% of pre	% of post	Length of plants	% of survival plants	% of efficacy
<i>Trichoderma harzianum</i>	40	0	58.3	60	33	26.7	0	60.3	73.3	55.5	26.7	0	65	73.3	55.5
<i>Bacillus subtilis</i>	33.3	0	57.3	66.7	44	26.7	0	62	73.3	55.5	20	0	69	80	66.6
<i>Pseudomonas flourescens</i>	26.7	16.7	52	56.6	27	40	0	56	60	33.3	26.7	0	59	73.3	55.5
<i>Mycorrhiza</i> (tri-ton)	46.7	0	48.3	53.3	22	33.3	0	50.6	66.7	44.5	21.7	0	78.3	78.3	63.83
<i>Moncerin</i>	43.3	0	46	56.7	27	26.7	0	43.6	73.3	55.5	26.7	0	33.3	73.3	55.5
Control	60	0	40.6	40	0.00	60	0	40.6	40	0.00	60	0	40.6	40	0.00
LSD at 5 %	2.18	0.15	2.52	2.18		2.3	N. S	1.82	3.04		2.52	N. S	2.81	2.52	

*A: Half (R. D.), B: Recommended dose (R. D), C: Double (R. D.)

Table 7: Effect of different preparations on fiber quality of the cotton plants

Different treatments	Fiber elongation %	Fiber strength g/tex	Fiber length		Microner reading (fiber fineness) maturity	Lea product	color	
			Uniformity index %	*2.5 % SL mm			**Yellowness +b	***Reflectance on Rd %
<i>Trichoderma harzianum</i>	7.8	34.06	87.8	32.6	4.4	2019.6	12	70.6
<i>Bacillus subtilis</i>	7.5	32.5	87.6	32.3	4.3	1912	11.8	69.1
Humic acid	7.6	32.2	86.2	31.1	4.3	1791	12.1	68.9
Calcium chloride	7.5	30.8	86.1	30.8	4.6	1676	12.1	67.5
Control	7.3	29.9	86.2	30.1	4.1	1639	11.6	67.2
LSD at 5 %	0.45	1.14	0.53	0.60	0.31	2.22	0.56	0.67

* Sl: Span length (staple length)

** b: degree of yellowness

*** Rd %: percentage reflectance (lightness or darkness of color)

compounds in the host (Howell *et al.*, 2000 and Bolar *et al.*, 2000). Such compounds might have the abilities to solubilize plant nutrient uptake (Altomare *et al.*, 1999, Yedidia *et al.*, 2001 and Harman *et al.*, 2004). *Bacillus subtilis* appeared in the second rank after *Trichoderma harzianum*. This might be due to that *B. subtilis* produces number of antibiotic and some growth promotores (Ferreira *et al.* 1991 and Ryder *et al.* 1999). Foliage treatment with CaCl_2 led to improvement in fiber fineness and maturity. This effect might be due to that calcium is responsible for formation of strong cell walls of fibers and in plant.

Data in Table (8) show the effect of different preparations on the oil content of cotton seeds. Treatment of *Trichoderma harzianum* significantly increased the percentage of oil in seeds. This might be due to direct increase plant growth (Chang *et al.*, 1986). They also might have abilities to solubilize plant nutrients and increase plant nutrient uptake (Altomare *et al.* 1999, Yedidia *et al.*, 2001 and Harman *et al.*, 2004).

On the other hand, obtained data showed no significant differences between all the past treatments and control one in cotton seed oil contents.

Table 8: Effect of different preparations on field quality of the oil percent of cotton seeds.

Different treatments	<i>Trichoderma harzianum</i>	<i>Bacillus subtilis</i>	Humic acid solution	Calcium chloride	control
% of oil in seeds	21.75	18.6	18.2	18.4	17

LSD at 5 % 2.27

REFERENCES

- Abd-El Moity, T.H 1981. Further studies on the biological control of white disease of onion. PhD. Thesis, Fac. Agric., Monofia Univ., PP. 135.
- Abd-El-Moity, T.H 1985. Effect of single and mixture of *Trichoderma harzianum* isolates on controlling three different soil borne pathogens. Egypt. J. Microbiol., special issue, 111 – 120.
- Abd-El-Moity, T.H and M.N. Shatla. 1981. Biological control of white rot disease of onion *Sclerotium cepivorum* by *Trichoderma harzianum*. Phytopathology Z., 100:29– 35.

- Abd-El Moity, T.H, HA. Eisa, and Afaf, M. Amr. 1990. Evaluation of some biocontrol agents in controlling cotton seedling disease. *Zagazig J. Agric. Res.*,17:(4A):1187- 1194.
- Abd-El Moity, T.H, Maisa, L. Abd-El-Monejm, M.M.M. Atia, A.Z. Aly, and M.R.A. Tohamy. 2003. Biological control of some cucumber diseases under organic agriculture. 227 - 236 *Proc. IS on Org. Matter and Substrates* Ed A. F. Abou Hadid *Acta Hort.* 608, ISHS 2003.
- Altomare, C., W.A Norvell, T. Bjorkman, and G.E. Harmony. 1999. Solubilization of Phosphates and micronutrients by the plant growth promoting and biocontrol fungus *Trichoderma harizanium* Rifai 1295 - 22. *Appl. Environ Microbial.* 65: 2926 - 2933.
- Aly, A.Z., M.I. Abou Zaid, M.S. Shalaby, and M.M.M. Atia. 1995. Biological and chemical control of watermelon and cantaloupe root-rot in the reclaimed soils. *Zagazig J. Agric. Res.* Vol. 22.
- A. O. C. S. 1970. Official and tentative method of analysis published by the American Oil Society. 2nd Ed. Chicago Illionois, U. S. A.
- Arisawa, M., T. Fujita, K. Hayashi, H Ochiai, and N. Morita. 1990. Cytotoxic and antiherpetic activity of phloroglucinol derivatives from *Mallotus japonicus* (Euphorbiaceae). *Chem. Pharm. Bull.* 38: 1624 - 1626.
- Asaka, O. and N. Shoda. 1996. Biocontrol of *Rhizoctonia solani* damping off of tomato with *Bacillus subtilis* RB 14. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology*, 62 (11): 4081-4085.
- ASTM. 1984. American Society for Testing and Materials. Standards of Textile Testing and Materials.; Philadelphia, pa.
- Bangera, M.G. and I.S. Thomashow. 1996. Characterization of a genomic locus required for synthesis of the antibiotic 2, 4 diacetylphloronomicglucinol by the biological control agent *Pseudomonas fluorescens* Q2-87. *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact.* 9: 83 - 90.
- Bangera, M.G. and I.S. Thomashow. 1999. Identification and Characterization of a gene cluster for synthesis of the polyketide antibiotic 2, 4 diacetylphloronomicglucinol from *Pesudomonus*

- fluorescens* Q2-87 J. Bacteriol. 181: 3155 – 3163.
- Bansal, M. and K.G. Mukerji. 1994. Positive correlation between VAM-induced changes in root exudation and mycorrhizosphere mycoflora. *Mycorrhiza* 5:39-44.
- Benhamous, W. and T. Chet. 1993. Hyphal interaction between *Trichoderma harzianum* and *Rhizoctonia solani* ultra structure and gold cytochemistry of the mycoparasitic process. *Phytopathology*, 83:1062-1071.
- Blasingame, D. and V.P. Mukund. 2001. Cotton disease loss estimate committee report. Pages 102 – 103 in: Proc. Beltwide Cotton Conf. Natl. Cotton Counc. Am. F. Duggar and D. A. Richter, eds. Nashville, TN.
- Bokesch, HR., A. Groweiss, C.T. Mackee, and M.R. Boyed. 1999. Laxifloranone. A new phloroglucinol derivative from *Marila laxiflora*. *J. Nat. Prod.* 62: 1197 – 1199.
- Bolar, J.P., J.L. Norelli, K.W. Wong, C.K. Hayes, Q.E. Harman, and H.S. Aldwinckie. 2000. Expression of endochitinase from *Trichoderma harzianum* in transgenic apple increase resistance to apple scab and reduce vigour. *Phytopathology*, 90 : 72 – 77.
- Brain, P.W. and HG Hemming. 1945. Gliotoxin a fungistatic metabolic product of *Trichoderma viride*. *Ann. Appl. Biol.*, 32 : 214 – 220.
- Chang. Y.C., R. Baker, O. Kleifeld, and I. Chet. 1986. Increased growth of plants in the presence of the biological control agent *Trichoderma harzianum*. *Plant Dis.* 70 : 145 – 148.
- Chet. I. 1987. *Trichoderma*-Application, mode of action and potential as a biocontrol agent of soil-borne plant pathogenic fungi. Pages 137-160 in: *Innovative Approaches to Plant Disease Control*. I. Chet. Ed. J. Wiley and Sons. New York.
- Cook, R.J., L.S. Tnomashow, D.M. Weller, D. Fujimoto, M. Mazzola, G. Banger, and D. S. Kim. 1995. Molecular Mechanisms of defense by rhizobacteria against root disease. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA.* 92:4197-4201.
- Cronin, D., Y. Moenne-Loccoz., A. Fenton, C. Dunne, D.N. Dowling, and F. O'Gara. 1997. Role of 2,4 diacetylphloronomicglucinol in the interactions of the biocontrol pseudomonad

- strain F113 with the potato cyst nematode *Globodera roschieusis*. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 63:1357-1361.
- Debabrata. S. and P. Naik. 2000. Phlorogucinol enhances growth and rate of axillary shoot proliferation in potato shoot tip cultures *invitro* Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult. 60:139-149.
- De Souza, J.T., C. Arnould, C. Deulvot, P. Lemanceau, V. Glaninazzi-Pearson, and J.M. Roaijmakers. 2003. Effect of 2,4 diacetylphloronomicglucinol on pythium: cellular responses and variation in sensitivity among propaguls and species. Phytopathology, 93:966 – 975.
- Dowson, W.J. 1957. Plant diseases due to bacteria Second Ed., Cambridge the University Press, London, pp. 23.
- Duffy, B.K. and G. Defago. 1997. Zinc improves biocontrol of Fusarium crown and root rot of tomato by *Pseudomonas fluorescens* and represses the production of pathogen metabolites inhibitory to bacterial antibiotic biosynthesis. Phytopathology, 87:1250–1257.
- Duncan, D.B. 1954. Multiple F test Biometrics. 11: 1 - 42.
- Farahat, A. 1998. Biological control of some potato bacterial diseases. Ph D. Thesis, Fac. Agric., Minufya, Univ., pp. 118.
- Ferreira, J.H.S., F.N. Matthee, and A.C. Thomas. 1991. Biological control of *Eutypa lata* on grapevine by an antagonistic strain *Bacillus subtilis*. Phytopathology 81:283-287.
- Filion, M., M. St-Arnaud, and S.H. Jabaji-Hare. 2003. Quantification of *Fusarium solani* f. sp. *phaseoli* in mycorrhizal bean plants and surrounding mycorrhizosphere soil using real-time polymerase chain reaction and direct isolations on selective media Phytopathology 93:229-235.
- Galal, Y.G.M., and B.E. Ali. 2004. Biofertilization and organic farming approaches. Egypt. J. Agric. Res, 2004, special issue Vol. 5 No. 1, 90 – 175.
- Gomez KwanChai, A. and A.A. Gomez. 1984. Statistical procedures for agricultural research, 2nd Ed. John Willey and Sons Ltd., New York, p 680.
- Gorosch, R. and D. Grote. 1998. Suppression of *Phytophthora nicotianae* by application of *Bacillus subtilis* in closed soilless culture of tomato

- plants. Gartenbauwissenschaft, 63 (3): 103 – 109 (cf. Rev. Pl. Pathol., 1999, Vol. 87, No. 1, 524).
- Hader, Y. and B. Gorodecki. 1991. Suppression of germination of sclerotia of *Sclerotium rolfsii* in compost. Soil Biology and Biochemistry, 23 (3):303 – 306.
- Hanson, L. E. and C.R. Howell. 2004. Elicitors of plant defense responses from biocontrol strains of *Trichoderma virens*. Phytopathology 94:171-176.
- Harman, G.E., R. Petzoldt, A. Comis, and J. Chen. 2004. Interactions between *Trichoderma harzianum* strain T22 and maize inbred line M017 and effects of these interactions on diseases caused by *Pythium ultimum* and *Colletotrichum graminicola*. Phytopathology 94:147-153.
- Hassan Dar, G. H, M. Zargar, and G.M. Beigh 1997. Biocontrol of Fusarium root rot in the common bean (*Phaseolus vulgaris* L.) by using symbiotic *glomus maseae* and *Rhizobium leguminosarum*. Microbiol. Ecol. 34:74-80.
- Hayes, C.K. 1992. Improvement of *Trichoderma* and *Gliocladium* by genetic manipulation P. 227 – 286. In biological control of plant disease progress and challenges for the future. T. Jamos, E. C.; G. C. Papavizas and R. J. Cook (eds) Plenum press, New York and London published in Co-operation with NATO Scientific Affairs Division, P 462.
- Howell, C.R., L.E. Hassan, R.D. Stipanovic, and L.S. Puckhaber. 2000. Induction of terpenoid synthesis in cotton roots and control of *Rhizoctonia solani* by seed treatment with *Trichoderma virens*. Phytopathology 90:248-252.
- Hwang, S.F., K.F. Chang, R.J. Howard, B.A. Denka, and G. D. Turnbull. 1996. Decrease in incidence of pythium damping off of field pea by seed treatment with *Bacillus spp.* and metalaxyl. Zeitschrift – Fur Pflanzenkrankheiten und Pflanzenschutz, 10 (1) : 31 – 41. (Cf. CAB, Abstract, 1996 – 1998).
- Ishiguro, K., N. Nagareya, and H .Fukumoto. 1998. A phloroglucinol derivative from cell suspension cultures of *Hypericum palatum*. Phytochemistry 47:1041-1043.
- Ito, H, T. Muranaka, K. Mori, Jin-H Zhexiong, Tokuda, H Nishino, T. Yoshida, and Z.X.

- Jin. 2000. Ichthyotoxic phoroglucinol derivative from *Dryopteris fragrans* and their anti-tumor promoting activity. Chem. Pharm Bull. 1190-1195.
- Johanson, L.F., R.A. Curl, J.H. Bon, and H.A. Fribourg. 1960. Methods for studying soil microflora plant disease relationships. Second printing burgess publishing Company, 1 - 17.
- Keel, C., U. Schnider, M. Maurhofer, C. Voisard, J. Laville, U. Burger, P.H. Wirthner, D. Haas, and G. Defago. 1992. Suppression of root diseases by *Pseudomonads* CHAO; Importance of the secondary metabolite 2-4 diacetylphloronomicglucinol. Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact. 5: 4 - 13.
- Landa, B.B., D.M. Mavrodi, L.S. Thomashow, and D.M. Weller. 2003. Interactions between strains of 2-4 diacetylphloronomicglucinol producing *Pseudomonas fluorescens* in rhizosphere of wheat. Phytopathology 93 : 982 - 994.
- Lawler, I.R., B.M. Eschler, D.M. Schliebs, and W.J. Foley. 1999. Relationship between chemical functional groups on Eucalyptus secondary metabolites and effectiveness as marsupial antifeedants. J. Chem. Ecol. 25:2561-2573.
- Linderman, R.G. 1992. Vesicular-arbusclar mycorrhiza and soil microbial interactions. Pages 45-70 in: mycorrhizae in sustainable agriculture. G. J. Bethlenfalvay and R. G. Linderman, eds. Publication No. 54. American Society of Agronomy, Madison, WI.
- Lindsey, D.L. and R. Baker. 1967. Effect of certain fungi on dwarf tomatoes grown under gnotobiotic conditions. Phytopathology 57:1262-1263.
- Loper, J.E. 1988. Role of Fluorescent siderophore Production in Biological control of *Pythium wiltium* by *Pseudomonas fluorescens* strain. Phytopathology, 78: 166 - 172.
- Misaghi, I.J., A. Heyderi, and K. Zaki. 1998. Non-chemical control of cotton seedling damping off in the field. AZ 1006:A College of Agric. Report, University of Arizona, Tucson, Arizona, 85721.
- Muchovej, J.J., R.M.C. Muchovej, and E.J. Concalves. 1991. Effect of kind and method of

- fungicidal treatment of bean seed on infection by the VA-mycorrhizal fungus *Glomus macrocarpum* and the pathogenic fungus *Fusarium solani*. Plant Soil. 132 : 47 – 51.
- Padares, D.F., J. Hockenhull, D. F. Jensen, and S.B. Mathur. 1992. *In vivo* screening of *Trichoderma* isolated for antagonism against *Sclerotium rolfsii* using rice seedlings. Bulletin Oil B / SROP, 15 (1): 33 – 35. (c.f. Rev. Pl. Pathol., 1993, Vol. 72, No. 1, 208).
- Rodriguez, R.F. and A.M. Cotes. 1999. Biological control of the bean root rot (*Rhizoctonia solani* Kuhm) using prefermentation control in the presence of *Trichoderma koningii* oudemans. Scolfi-informa, 25 (1): 3 – 4 (cited from CAB Abstracts 1998 – 1999).
- Ryder, M.H, Z.H Yan, T.E. Terrace, A.D. Rovira, W. Tang, R.L. Correll, Z.H Yan, and W. Tang. 1999. Use of strain of *Bacillus* isolated in China to suppress take all and *Rhizoctonia* root rot and to promote wheat seedling growth of glasshouse grown wheat in Australian soils. Soil Biology and Biochemistry, 31(1):19–29.
- Sarnigute, A., J. Kraus, M.D. Henkels, A.M. Muehlchen, and J.E. Loper. 1995. The sigma factor affects antibiotic production and biological control activity of *Pseudomonas fluorescens* Pf – 5 Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 92 : 12255 – 12259.
- Schwab, S.M., R.T. Leonard and J.A. Menge. 1984. Quantitative qualitative comparison of root exsudates of mycorrhizal and nonmycorrhizal plant species. Can. J. Bot. 62:1227-1231.
- Sharifi, T.A., M. Zala, A. Natsch, Y. Moenneloccoz, and G. Defago. 1998. Biocontrol of soil borne fungal plant diseases by 2 – 4 diacetylphloronomi-cglucinol producing fluorescent pseudomonas with different restriction profiles of amplified, 16S RDWA. European Journal of Plant Pathology, 104 (7): 631 – 643. (c.f. Rev. Pl. Pathol., 1991, Vol. 78, No. 3, 2073).
- Smith, S. E. and D.J. Read. 1997. Mycorrhizal symbiosis. 2 nd ed. Academic Press, Cambridge.
- Te-Chato, S. and M. Lim. 1999. Plant regeneration of mangosteen via nodular callus formation. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult. 59:98-93.
- Toda, M., T. Takakuwa, M. Nagai, and T. Yoshii. 1990. Antiviral

- and antimicrobial activity of 2-4 di-acetylphloronomicglucinol, 2-acylcyclohexane-1,3-diones and 2-carboxamidocyclohexane-1,3-diones. *Agric. Biol. Chem.* 54 : 3061-3063.
- Wolk, M. and S. Sorkar. 1994. Antagonism *in vivo* of *Bacillus spp.* Against *Rhizoctonia solani* and *Pythium spp.* *Anzeiger für Schadling Skundey Pflanzenchutz, Umweltschutz*, 67 (1) : 1- 5. (cf. *Rev. Pl. Path.*, 1994 Vol. 73, No. 6, 4601).
- Yajima, T. and K. Munakata, 1979. Phloroglucinol-type furocumarins, a group of potent naturally-occurring insect antifeedants. *Agric. Biol. Chem.* 43:1701-1706.
- Yedidia, I., A.K. Srivastva, Y. Kapulnik, and I. Chet. 2001. Effect of *Trichoderma harzianum* on microelement concentrations and increased growth of cucumber plants. *Plant soil* 235:235-242.

تأثير بعض المعاملات الغير كيمياوية على البذور والمجموع الخضري في
مقاومة مرض موت البادرات في القطن وتأثيرها
على الصفات المحصولية لمحصول القطن

مايسة لطفى عبد المنعم

المعمل المركزى للزراعة العضوية - مركز البحوث الزراعية- جيزة - مصر

تم معاملة بذور القطن بأربعة كائنات حية دقيقة نافعة وهى (ترايكودرما هارزيتام، باسلس ستلس وسيدوموناس فلورسنت وخليط من فطريات الميكروهيزا وهى جلوماس إنتيكاتم وجلوماس انتروديكس جلوماس فاسكيلينم) وذلك لدراسة تأثيرها على مقاومة مرض موت البادرات فى القطن وذلك مقارنة مع الجرعة الموصى بها من مبيد المونسرين وقد أجريت المعاملات تحت ظروف الصوبة (حيث التربة التى تم عدوتها صناعيا) وظروف الحقل (حيث العدوى الطبيعية للتربة).

معاملات المجموع الخضري تمت فقط تحت ظروف الحقل المفتوح وذلك لدراسة تأثيرها على جودة المحصول والمحتوى الزيتى للبذور. ولقد أشتملت المعاملات على تحضيرات من الترايكودرما هارزيتام، باسلس ستلس وحامض الهيوميك وكلوريد الكالسيوم. ولقد أظهرت نتائج الصوبة أن البذور التى تم نقعها لمدة ٤٨ ساعة فى تجهيزات التريكودرما هارزيتام، باسلس ستلس أعطت أفضل مقاومة للمرض وقد أعطت أعلى عدد للنباتات الحية الباقية وذلك مقارنة بالكنترول (المقارنة). والنتائج أظهرت أيضا علاقة موجبة بين حماية النباتات ومقاومته للمرض وتركيز تجهيزات الكائنات الحية وطول فترة نقع البذور بها.

النتائج المتحصل عليها فى تجارب الحقل كانت متوافقة مع النتائج المتحصل عليها فى الصوبة وذلك فى مقاومة مرض موت البادرات والنباتات الباقية. كما تم تحديد طول النباتات التى ظلت باقية عند عمر شهر وذلك فى كل التجارب. وأظهرت النتائج أن أفضل معاملة كانت الترايكودرما هارزيتام يليها معاملة الباسلس ستلس إذا تم مقارنتها بمعاملة المبيد أو المقارنة. وبالنظر إلى تأثير معاملات المجموع الخضري على جودة الألياف والمحتوى الزيتى للبذور أظهرت النتائج أن المعاملات المختلفة كانت ذات تأثير متغير على القياسات المختلفة. وقد تم دراسة تأثير هذه المعاملات على اللون، طول الغزل، متانة الغزل، نسبة الاستطالة، نعومة الغزل ونضوجه والمحتوى الزيتى للبذور ولقد أظهرت معاملة التريكودرما هارزيتام أفضل النتائج على القياسات المختلفة وكانت ذات تأثير إيجابى على اللون وطول الغزل ومتانته ونسبة الاستطالة ونعومة الغزل ونضوجه وعلى نسبة الزيت كما أنها لم تؤثر معنويا على اللون الأصفر فى الغزل. ولقد احتلت معاملة الباسلس ستلس الدرجة الثانية بعد معاملة الترايكودرما هارزيتام بينما أدت إلى زيادة نضج الغزل وطوله. أدت المعاملة بكلوريد الكالسيوم إلى زيادة نعومة الألياف ونضجها بينما كانت معاملة حامض الهيوميك بتركيز ٤٥% فى ١٠٠ ملل/ ٢٠ لتر لم تعطى أى تغير معنوى فى أى قياس مقارنة بالكنترول (المقارنة).