

Toxicity of some pesticides and oil plant extracts to plant sucking pests

El-Khodary, A. S. *, M. A. Samy**, A. Y. Keratum***
and S. K. M. El-Fakharany**

*Department of Economic Entomology, Faculty of Agriculture, University
of Kafr El-Sheikh

**Plant Protection Research Institute

*** Department of Pesticides, Faculty of Agriculture, University of Kafr El-Sheikh

ABSTRACT

Toxicity of certain compounds including pesticides (fenitrothion and etoxazole), mineral oil (KZ-oil), plant oils extracted from citrus such as (baladi mandarin *Citrus deliciosa* Blanc, sour orange *Citrus aurantium* L., acidless orange *Citrus sinensis* Osbek) and blue gum *Eucalyptus globulus* L., microbial pesticides (Biofly and Agerin) and mixtures of [KZ-oil with plant oils or microbial pesticides] against nymphs of *Thrips tabaci* Lind., adult of *Aphis gossypii* Glover and adult females of *Tetranychus urticae* Koch, were evaluated under laboratory conditions. Results revealed that fenitrothion gave high toxic effect against all tested pests., *T. tabaci*, *A.gossypii* and *T. urtica*. Etoxazole was the least toxic compound against *T.tabaci* while high toxic for *A. gossypii*. The plant oils, blue gum, sour orange and acidless orange have a moderate toxicity to *A. gossypii* while slight toxicity to *T.urtica*. KZ-oil was higher toxic against *T.urtica* than all tested plant oils. Also the results showed that Biofly and Agerin were highly toxic to *T.tabaci* and *A.gossypii* while their moderately toxic to *T. urtica*. Clearly a tested mixtures had a potential effect against *T.tabaci*, *A.gossypii*, and *T.urtica*.

INTRODUCTION

Sucking pests considered to be the most serious pests attacking field crops such as, vegetables, fruits and ornamental plants, and it causes a great damage through their feeding and draining of the plant sap, in addition to their importance as vectors of several pathogens such as virus and bacteria besides excreting different amounts of sticky honey dew during the feeding process which cover plants and provides an ideal media for fungal growth (Butler and Henneberry, 1986 and Harris *et al.*, 1992).

A wide range of chemicals have been marketing for controlling pests. The intensive use of chemical compounds resulted many problems such as population out breaks of the pests and its resistance development against all known pesticide groups and also, many of these chemicals have residues in the environment which constitute toxic hazards to human health, domestic animals and wildlife generally.

Alternatively, non-chemical control methods have been widely assessed, and the most successful non-chemical techniques had been the exploitation of predators (Saied *et al.*, 2002 and Sharaf and El-Basyouni, 2002) which are commonly found in agricultural ecosystems.

The present study aimed to evaluate the toxic effect of certain compounds including two pesticides (Fenitrothion and Etoxazole), mineral oil (KZ-oil), plant oils (extracted from citrus and blue gum), microbial pesticides (Biofly and Agerin A), and mixture of [KZ- oil with plant oils or two microbial pesticides], against some plant sucking pests (*T. tabaci* Lind. nymphs, *A. gossypii* Glover adults and *T. urticae* Koch adult females) under laboratory conditions.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

1- Tested Pests: *Aphis gossypii* and *Tetranychus urtica* Koch., were obtained from infested watermelon plantations, while *Thrips tabaci* Lind. Colonies were obtained from infested onion plants from Kafr El- Sheikh fields, and reared on watermelon plants (*Cucurbit lanatus* var. *colocynthoids*) under laboratory conditions (21 ± 2 C and $55 \pm 5\%$ R.H).

2- Tested Compounds:

2-1 Pesticides : Baroque (10% SC), Etoxazole (RS) – 5-tert-butyl-2[2-(2, 6-difluorophenyl)-4,5-dihydro-1,3-oxazol-4-yl] phenetole Sumithion (50% EC), Fenitrothion (O,O-dimethyl O-4-nitro-m-tolyl phosphorothioate)

2-2 Mineral oil: K.Z. oil (95% EC)

2-3 Plant oils:

a) crude extracts: Volatile oil extractions from citrus fruit peels of [(*Citrus deliciosa* Blanc, baladi mandarin), (*Citrus aurantium* L., sour orange) and (*Citrus sinensis* Osbek, acidless orange)] (Family: *Rutaceae*)

were extracted in Pesticide Department , Faculty of Agriculture Kafr El-Shiekh University, by steam distillation using the method of A.O.A.C. (1990) with Clavenger trap apparatus on the basis (the oils are lighter than water).

b) Blue gum : *Eucalyptus globules L.*(trade shopping)

2-4 Microbial pesticides: Biofly , *Beauvaria bassiana* as a microbial liquid pesticide containing 3×10^7 conidia/ml. Agerin , *Bacillus thuringiensis* kurstaki 32000 I.U. /mg. (6.4 a.i W.P). The tested compounds were supplied by Plant Protection Research Institute, Agriculture Research Center, Dokki, Egypt.

3- Experiments :

a) Evaluation of oils and chemical pesticides toxicity:

The toxicity of tested formulated compounds was evaluated by leaf disc dip technique. While mineral and Plant oils were evaluated according to method of FAO, (1980). Four discs of watermelon leaves were dipped in each concentration of the concentration serious 125, 250, 500, 1000 and 2000 ppm for 5 seconds after air dried, 10 adults of *A. gossypii*, *T. urticae* or 10 nymphs of *T. tabaci* were transferred to each disc. The discs were placed on moist filter paper, pads mounted in Petri dishes and kept under ($21 \pm 2^\circ\text{C}$ and $55 \pm 5\%$ R.H). Mortality counts were recorded after 24hours from treatment with the aid of binocular. The mortality percentage was corrected according to Abbott's Formula (1925). Data were plotted on log-dosage probit papers and statistically analyzed according to Finney's method (1952).

b) Evaluation of microbial pesticide toxicity:

The bio-compounds, Biofly and Agerin, were diluted with distilled water to prepare the concentrations of (15000, 30000, 60000, 90000 and 120000 conidia/ml) and (15, 30, 60, 120, and 240 ppm), respectively. Also four discs of watermelon leaves were dipped in each concentration and exposed to the tested pests. The mortality counts were recorded after 24, 48, 72 and 96 hours from treatment. The Mortality percentages were corrected and statistically analyzed as mentioned before.

c) Evaluation of mixtures toxicity:

Toxicity of the mixtures of the mineral oil plus each plant oil extracts or tested bio-insecticides was investigated against the same pests.

The joint action effect of tested compounds in combination was evaluated by the following equation (Mansour et al., 1966):

$$\text{Co-toxicity factor} = \frac{\text{Observed mortality \%} - \text{Expected mortality \%}}{\text{Expected mortality \%}} \times 100$$

Where: + 20 or more = synergistic effect
Between + 20 and - 20 = additive effect
- 20 or low = antagonistic effect

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

1- Toxicity of tested compounds to *T. tabaci*, *A. gossypii* and *T. urticae*:
Results in Table (1) showed that fenitrothion was the most toxic compound against *T. tabaci* nymphs followed by KZ-oil with LC_{50,s} values of 1.67 and 286.64 ppm., respectively . While the plant oil extracts: baladi mandarin, blue gum, sour orange and acidless orange have a slight toxicities and the LC_{50,s} values were 1504.78, 1591.85 , 1781.93 and 1820.47 ppm., respectively. Etoxazole was the least toxic to *T. tabaci* nymphs with LC₅₀ of 6079.11 ppm.

The obtained result was agreed with Moustafa *et al.* (1985) Nasseh and Link (1990), Rizk *et al.* (1999) and Iskander and El-Sisi (2001) , Al-Fawaeer and Abu-Abeid (2002) and Abdel-Aziz *et al.* (2002). Results in Table (1) indicated that fenitrothion was the most toxic compound followed by baladi mandarin oil extract and KZ-oil to *A. gossypii* with LC₅₀ values of 1.66, 24.29 and 25.79 ppm, respectively.

While etoxazole has a moderate toxicity with LC₅₀ of 159.22 ppm., but blue gum, sour orange and acidless orange oil extracts were the least toxic to *A. gossypii* with LC₅₀ values of 236.70, 286.98 and 289.37 ppm, respectively.

The results obtained are in agreement with those recorded by Shaheen *et al.* (1992), Nassef *et al.* (1996) , Misra (2002), Sharaf and El-Basyouni (2002)., Haydar *et al.* (1996) and Guirguis *et al.* (1991).

Table (1): Toxicity of some chemical pesticides, mineral oil and plant oil extracts against *T. tabaci* nymphs, *A. gossypii* adults and *T. urticae* adult females.

| Compounds | | <i>T. tabaci</i> | <i>A. gossypii</i> | <i>T. urticae</i> |
|---------------------|-----------------|------------------------------|---------------------------|------------------------------|
| | | LC ₅₀ (ppm) | LC ₅₀ ppm | LC ₅₀ ppm |
| Chemical pesticides | Fenitrothion | 1.67 (1.36 2.02)* | 1.66 (1.31 2.08) | 411.22 (302.71 543.73) |
| | Etoxazol | 6079.11 (5050.8 7815.7) | 159.22 (106.32 218.10) | 9445.44 (8205.77 11000.8) |
| Mineral oils | KZ oil | 286.64 (233.94 345.85) | 25.79 (18.13 36.96) | 242.80 (174.10 313.24) |
| Plant oil extracts | Baladi mandarin | 1504.78 (1194.99 1959.72) | 24.29 (18.24 31.92) | 769.84 (212.41 1830.18) |
| | Sour orange | 1781.93 (685.94 18007.91) | 286.98 (223.33 355.52) | 1278.79 (1053.65 1567.90) |
| | Acidless orange | 1820.47 (678.06 27505.45) | 289.37 (203.24 381.78) | 2004.90 (1525.09 2885.81) |
| | Blue gum | 1591.85 (800.49 4684.42) | 236.70 (168.92 305.78) | 1416.24 (1145.41 1789.19) |

*Ninety five percent lower and upper fiducial limits

Based on LC₅₀ values presented in Table (1) KZ-oil was the highest toxic compound against *T. urticae* (LC₅₀= 242.80 ppm) followed by fenitrothion (LC₅₀= 411.22 ppm) and baladi mandarin oil extract (LC₅₀= 769.84 ppm)., The volatile oils of sour orange, blue gum and acidless orange and etoxazole have LC₅₀ values of 1278.79, 1416.24 , 2004.90 and 9445.44 ppm, respectively. Similar results obtained by Osman, (1997); El-Naggar, (2000); Gamieh *et al.*, (2000); Saied *et al.*,(2002) and Magouz, (2003).

2- Toxicity of microbial pesticides, Biofly and Agerin to *T.tabaci*, *A.gossypii* and *T.urtica*: The entomopathogenic (Biofly) fungus, *Beauveria bassiana* and (Agerin) Bacteria, *Bacillus thuringiensis* were investigated against *T. tabaci* nymphs, *A. gossypii* adults and *T. urticae* adult females has been studied under laboratory conditions of (21± 2 °C and 55 ± 5% R.H). Toxicity of Biofly and Agerin are presented in Table (2). The LC₅₀ values for *T. tabaci* Lind. Were 49376.38 conidia/ml of Biofly and 57.72 ppm (1847040 IU/ mg) of Agerin after 48 hours of exposure time, respectively. The results also showed that the LC₅₀ of Biofly was 23748.32 conidia/ml and 29.13 ppm (932160 IU/ mg) for Agerin against *A. gossypii* after 48 hours of exposure time.

Data in Table (2) revealed that the LC₅₀s were 57857.82 conidia/ml of Biofly and 103.23 ppm (3303360 IU /mg) of Agerin against *T. urticae*, after 48 hr. Biofly was effective against *T. urticae* and this result is in agreement with that recorded by Saenz de *et al.* (2003).and Zakzouk (2003). The recommended concentrations for field application is 3x10⁴ conidia/ml and 1 g/liter of Biofly and Agerin, respectively.

3- Toxicity of binary mixtures of KZ - oil and plant oil extracts or microbial pesticides to *T. tabaci*, *A. gossypii* and *T. urticae*:

Six mixtures of the mineral oil (KZ-oil) with four plant oil extracts (baladi mandarin, sour orange, acidless orange and blue gum) or with the two microbial pesticides (Biofly and Agerin) were tested against *T. tabaci* nymphs, *A. gossypii* adults and *T. urticae* adult females. Pests were subjected to sublethal concentrations (LC₂₅'s) deduced from the regression lines of each compound.

Table (2): Toxicity of Biofly (*Beauvaria bassiana*) and Agerin (*Bacillus thuringiensis*) to *T. tabaci* nymphs, *A. gossypii* adults and *T. urticae* adult females.

| Compound | <i>T. tabaci</i> | | | | <i>A. gossypii</i> | | | | <i>T. urticae</i> | | | |
|----------|-------------------------------------|-------------------|----------|-------|------------------------------------|-------------------|----------|-------|--------------------------------------|-------------------|---------|-------|
| | LC ₅₀ | Confidence limits | | Slope | LC ₅₀ | Confidence limits | | Slope | LC ₅₀ | Confidence limits | | Slope |
| | | Lower | Upper | | | Lower | Upper | | | Lower | Upper | |
| Biofly | 49376.38 conidia/ml | 39753.75 | 60786.79 | 2.15 | 23748.32 conidia/ml | 12470.81 | 33664.61 | 1.31 | 57857.82 conidia/ml | 43323.8 | 80271.7 | 1.48 |
| Agerin | 57.72 ppm (1847040 IU/ mg) | 44.38 | 74.70 | 1.76 | 29.13 ppm (932160 IU/ mg) | 17.19 | 42.10 | 1.15 | 103.23 ppm (3303360 IU/ mg) | 76.75 | 150.94 | 1.49 |

Table (3): Toxicity of binary mixtures of KZ-oil with plant oil extracts and (Biofly & Agerin) to *T. tabaci*, *A.gossypii* and *T.urtica*.

| Combination | <i>T. tabaci</i> | | <i>A. gossypii</i> | | <i>T. urticae</i> | |
|----------------------------|---------------------|--------------------|---------------------|--------------------|---------------------|--------------------|
| | Observed% mortality | Co-toxicity factor | Observed% mortality | Co-toxicity factor | Observed% mortality | Co-toxicity factor |
| Kz-oil+Baladi mandarin oil | 85 | +70 | 97.5 | +95 | 90 | +80 |
| Kz-oil+Sour orange oil | 82.5 | +65 | 100 | +100 | 75 | +50 |
| Kz-oil+Acidless orange oil | 70 | +40 | 100 | +100 | 74 | +48 |
| Kz-oil+Blue gum oil | 77.5 | +55 | 97.5 | +95 | 80 | +60 |
| Kz-oil+Biofly | 87.5 | +75 | 100 | +100 | 87.5 | +75 |
| Kz-oil+Agerin | 75 | +50 | 100 | +100 | 80 | +60 |

Data presented in Table (3) showed different levels of potentiations for the six pairs of mixtures. KZ-oil mixed with the tested plant oils gave different co-toxicity levels against *T. tabaci* + 70, 65, 40 and 55 for baladi mandarin, sour orange, acidless orange and blue gum respectively while KZ-oil with microbial pesticides gave + 75 and 50 co-toxicity factor for Biofly and Agerin, respectively. The same mixtures against *A. gossypii* showed almost 100% co-toxicity levels. In the case of *T. urticae*, the co-toxicity factors of tested mixture ranged from +48 to + 80. Zein *et al.* (2002) reported potentiation effect of KZ-oil + black pepper extract against *T. urticae* adults. Moreover, the joint action of mixtures of plant oils or mineral oils with pesticides was found to be effective against *T. tabaci*, *A.gossypii* and *Turtica* as showed by many investigators (Barakat *et al.*, 1985; Haydar *et al.*, 1996, and Helmy *et al.*, 2002).

REFERENCES

- Abbott, W.W. (1925). A method of computing the effectiveness of an insecticide. *J. Econ. Entomol.*, 18: 265-267.
- Abdel-Aziz, S.Y.; Mohamed, S.A. and Abdel-Wahab, S. (2002). Efficiency of four seed plant oils for controlling certain pests in eggplant fields. 2nd Int. Conf. Plant Protect. Res. Instit. Cairo, Egypt, 21-24 December.
- Al-Fawaer, M.S. and Abu-Abeid, I. (2002). Integrated pest management of onion thrips *Thrips tabaci* Lindman (Thysanoptera: Thripidae) under protective conditions. 2nd Int. Conf. Plant Protect. Res. Instit. Cairo, Egypt, 21-24 December.
- A.O.A.C. (1990). Association of Official Agricultural Chemists, Official Methods of Analysis. Washington, U.S.A.
- Barakat, A.A.; Shereef, G.M.; Abdallah, S.A. and Amer, S.A.A. (1985). Joint action of some pesticides and plant extracts against *Tetranychus urticae* Koch. *Bull. Ent. Soc. Egypt*, 14: 243-249.

- Butler, G.D. Jr. and Henneberry, T.J. (1986). Effect of cotton seedling infestation by cotton leaf crumple virus on subsequent growth and yield. *J. Econ. Entomol.*, 79: 208-211.
- El-Naggar, I.B.A. (2000). Toxicological studies of some pesticides on some vegetable crops. Ph.D. Thesis, Fac. Agric. Tanta Univ., pp. 141.
- F.A.O. (1980). F.A.O. method No.17.
- Finney, D.J. (1952). Probit analysis. Cambridge Univ. Press, New York p256.
- Gamieh, G.N.; Saadoon, S.E.; Masef, A.M. and Younes, A.A. (2000). Efficacy of mineral oils, acaricides and their mixtures against *Tetranychus cucurbitacearum* (Sayed). *Zagazig J. Agric. Res.*, 27 (2): 591-601.
- Guirguis, M.W.; Gouhar, K.M.; Watson, W.M.; Ibrahim, N.A. and Salem, R. (1991). The toxic action of volatile oils extracted from citrus fruit peels against different insect pests. *Egypt, J. Agric. Res.*, 69 (1): 163-177.
- Harris, F.A.; Andrews, G.L.; Gaillave, D.F. and Furr, Jr. R.E. (1992). Cotton aphid effect on yield, quality and economics of cotton .pp.652-656 in Proceedings Beltwide Cotton Production and Res. Conf. Nashville, TN, National Cotton of America, Memphis, TN.
- Haydar, M.F.; Dawood, M.Z. and Ibrahim, S.M. (1996). The efficiency of mineral oils, some insecticides and their mixtures against *Aphis gossypii* Glover. *J. Agric. Sci. Mansoura Univ.*, 21 (6): 2343-2346.
- Helmy, E.; Hemeida, I.A.; El-Shabrawy, H.A. and El-Sahn, O.N.I. (2002). Survey of insects associated with roselle; *Hibiscus sabdariffa* L. and soft control of the most injurious insects; *Aphis gossypii* Glover and *Bemisia tabaci* (Genn.) at Beni Sweif, Egypt. 2nd Int. Conf. Plant Protect. Res. Inst. Cairo, Egypt, 21-24 December.

- Iskander, N.N. and El-Sisi, A.G. (2001). Field evaluation of some local formulated plants and mineral oils against sucking insects infesting bean plants. *J. Agric. Sci. Mansoura Univ.*, 26 (7): 4531-4535.
- Magouz, R.S.I. (2003). Integrated spider mite management. Ph.D. Thesis, Fac. Agric. Kafrr ElSheikh, Tanta Univ., pp.253.
- Mansour, N.A.; El-Defrawi, M.E.; Topozada, A. and Zeid, M. (1966). Toxicological studies on the Egyptian cotton leafworm *Prodonia litura* VI. Potentiation and antagonism of organophosphorus and carbamate insecticides. *J. Econ. Entomol.*, 59 (2) : 307-311.
- Misra, H.P. (2002). Field evaluation of some newer insecticides against aphids (*Aphis gossypii*) and jassids (*Amrasca biguttula biguttula*) on okra. *India J. Entomol.*, 64 (1): 80-84.
- Moustafa, O.K.; El-Attal, Z.M and El-Attal, A.M. (1985). Enhancement of the efficiency of some insecticides against thrips and cotton leafworm by mineral oil *J. Agric. Sci.*, UK 105 (1) : 63-66.
- Nassef, M.A.; Sharaf, F.H. and Watson, W.M. (1996). Evaluation of the efficiency of certain insecticides against *Aphis gossypii* infesting cotton plants. *J. Agric. Sci. Mansoura Univ.*, 21 (11): 4101-4107.
- Nasseh, O.M. and Link, R. (1990). Action of insecticides against premature fruit fall in pomegranate (*Punica granatum*) in the Yemen Arab Republic. *Mitteilungen der Deutschen Gesellschaft für Allgemeine und Angewandte Entomologie*, 7 (4-6) : 430-433.
- Osman, M.S. (1997). Petroleum oils as compounds of integrated pest management of phytophagous mites. *Arab Gulf J. Sci. Res.*, 15 (1): 125-135.
- Rizk, M.A.; El-Sisi, A.G.; Badr, N.A. and Abdel-Halim, S.M. (1999). Controlling of cotton sucking pests using safe materials. 2nd, Cont. Conf. Pest Control Mansoura, Egypt, September , pp. 211-221.
- Saenz, C.I.De.; Mancebon, F.J.M. and Morene, V.I.P. (2003). The entomopathogenic fungus *Beauveria bassiana* and its compatibility

with triflumuron effects on the two spotted spider mite *Tetranychus urticae*. *Biological Control*, 26 (2): 168-173.

Saied, A.A.A.; Shahien, F.A. ; Hamid, A.M. and El-Zahi, E.S. (2002). Effect of certain natural and specific materials on some sucking pests and their associated natural enemies in cotton crop. 2nd Int. Conf. Plant Protection Research Institute, Cairo, Egypt. 21-24 December.

Shaheen, F.A.H.; Hosny, A.; Belal, A.H. and Nassef, A.M. (1992). Effect of certain insecticides on *Aphis gossypii* Glov. and its predator *Chrysoprla carnea* Steph. in cotton fields. *J. Agric. Res., Tanta Univ.*, 18 (2) : 403-408.

Sharaf, F.H. and El-Basyouni, S.A. (2002). Searching for chemicals can be used in aphid management in cotton fields. 2nd Inter. Conf. Plant Protect. Res. Instit. Cairo, Egypt, 21-24 December.

Zakzouk, E.A. (2003). Effect of certain pesticides on common phytophagous and soil mites' species in apple orchard. *J.Agric.Sci.Mansoura Univ.*, 28 (5):4039-4046.

Zien, A.A.; Ahmed, F.A.M.; Tag El-Din, M.H. and El-Naggar, J.B. (2002). Toxicological studies of some pesticides on certain vegetable crops pests 1- Toxicity and joint action effects of some compounds against certain vegetable crops pests. *J. Agric. Sci. Mansoura Univ.*, 27 (12) : 8679-8694.

المخلص العربي

تعرض نباتات الخضر للعديد من الآفات التي تؤثر عليها من ناحية الجودة وكمية المحصول ومن أهمها الآفات الماصة (الحشرية والحيوانية)، ونظرا لخطورة المبيدات على كل من الإنسان والحيوان والبيئة فان هذه الدراسة تهدف إلى دراسة التأثير السام لبعض المبيدات الموصى بها والزيوت النباتية المستخلصة من قشور ثمار الموالح (يوسفي، نارنج، برتقال سكري) وزيت الكافور، وكذلك تأثير بعض الزيوت المعدنية (كزرد) وبعض المبيدات الحيوية (الأجيريون والبيوفلاي)، بالإضافة إلى مخالط هذه المركبات السابقة مع (كزد) على حوريات تريس البصل ومن البطيخ والإناث البالغة من العنكبوت الأحمر بعد التغذية على أقراص أوراق نبات البطيخ المعاملة تحت الظروف المعملية.

وأظهرت النتائج أن: مبيد فينيتروثيون (السومثيون) كان أكثر المركبات سمية يليه زيت (كزد) بينما كانت الزيوت النباتية المستخلصة ذات تأثير متوسط السمية في حين كان مبيد ايتوكسازول (الباروك) أقل المركبات سمية على حوريات تريس البصل. كما أظهرت النتائج المتحصل عليها أن مبيد فينيتروثيون (السومثيون) كان أكثر المركبات سمية يليه الزيت المستخلص من قشور البرتقال البلدي ثم زيت (كزد) و ايتوكسازول (الباروك) كان له سمية متوسطة بينما كانت باقى الزيوت النباتية المستخلصة المختبرة منخفضة السمية على حشرة المن. زيت كزد كان أكثر المركبات سمية ثم يليه فينيتروثيون (السومثيون) وزيت البرتقال البلدي. كما أظهرت النتائج أيضا أن الزيوت النباتية المستخلصة الأخرى متوسطة السمية، في حين كان ايتوكسازول (الباروك) منخفض السمية على الإناث البالغة للعنكبوت الأحمر. على الجانب الأخر أظهرت النتائج أن المبيدات الحيوية كانت سميتها عالية على التريس والمن بينما كانت سميتها متوسطة على الأكاروس. وكذلك أوضحت النتائج أن كل المخالط من خلال معاملة السمية المشترك قد أحدثت تأثير تقوية ضد كل الآفات المختبرة.