

FIELD TRIALS FOR CONTROLLING THE CITRUS LEAFMINER *Phyllocnistis citrella* (Stain.) (LEPIDOPTERA, PHYLLOCNISTIDAE) IN EGYPT
BY

El-Abbassi, T.S.; Mosallam, A.M.Z. and Anas A. Ahmed
 Plant Protection Research Institute, Dokki, Giza, Egypt

ABSTRACT

Field trials for controlling citrus leafminer (CLM) *Phyllocnistis citrella* (Stain.) on summer flushes of navel orange trees using different pesticides in two successive seasons (2006 and 2007) at Sharkia Governorate were conducted. Abamectin mixed with the mineral oil Chermi oil was the most effective tested pesticides during 2006 season. Effect of Dimectin 1.8% EC + Chermi oil extended for 4 weeks after application. In addition, Dimectin had no adverse effect on percent of parasitism among all tested pesticides. Data obtained from trials conducted in 2007 season revealed that the organophosphorus insecticide Elsan 50% EC was the most effective among the three tested insecticides. Besides, it had no adverse effect on percent of parasitism. Matador 35%EC (neonicotinoid group) was the least effective tested product. However, percent of parasitism was significantly higher than untreated control. Suntap 50%SP (thiocarbamate group) gave promising results of 4 weeks after application. However, it induced high significant adverse effect on percent of parasitism. Usage of either Dimectin 1.8% EC (abamectin) + the mineral oil Chermi oil or Elsan 50% EC (phenthoate) used alone could be recommended to control *P. citrella*, protect new flushes of navel orange trees for at least 4 weeks and less adverse effect on percent of parasitism.

INTRODUCTION

Citrus leafminer (CLM), *P. citrella* (St.) is a delicate microlepidopteran insect which cause severe damage for newly tender leaves during the different periods of flushes of citrus trees especially young trees or seedlings in Egypt and other countries (Ayoub, 1960; Badawy, 1967; Heppner, 1995; Gonzalez & Stein, 1996; Kfoury & El-Amil, 1998 and Salas & Goane, 2001). Infestation reduces rate of photosynthesis followed by retardation in growth and reduction in fruit yield.

Several trials for controlling this pest, all over the world, using different insecticides were conducted (Boulahia *et al.*, 1996; Nucifora, 1996; Rezk *et al.*, 1996; Salas *et al.*, 1997; Korashy, 1998; Mustafa & Ateyyat, 1998; Raja *et al.*, 1998a & b; Bei XuFang *et al.*, 1999; Moraes *et al.*, 1999; Vargas *et al.*,

1999; Lej BangHai & Wu QiNeng., 2000; Villanueva- Jimenez *et al.*, 2000; Yamamoto *et al.*, 2000; Zhang QuanBing *et al.*, 2001; Pizza & Moleas, 2002 and Mosallam *et al.*, 2008).

The aim of this study is to find out appropriate control measure to suppress CLM population density on summer flushes of navel orange trees to protect autumn flushes from infestation. On the other hand, selecting a chemical control treatment which may induce least adverse effect on CLM parasites. Achieving a proper summer treatment regimes able to protect citrus orchards from expected increment of CLM population 4-5 weeks prior emergence of autumn flushes will also reduce environmental pollution, disturbance of natural balance and probable problems of high insecticide residues in winter fruits.

MATERIAL AND METHODS

Field experiments on navel orange trees (8-10 years old) severely infested with *P. citrella* were conducted. An orchard of about 25 feddans at Meniat EL-Kamh district, Sharkia Governorate was selected. Citrus trees were cultivated in clay soil. Distance between trees were 5x5 meters and irrigated using flood irrigation regime. Experiments were carried out on summer flushes for two successive years (2006 and 2007).

Used Insecticides

(A) 2006 season

1. Abamectin:
 - a- Dimectin 1.8% EC
 - b- Mectin 1.8% EC
2. Lufenuron (Match 5% EC)
3. Spinosad (Tracer 24% SC)
4. Thiamethoxam (Actara 25%WG)
5. Mineral oil (Chemi oil 95% EC)

(B) 2007 season

1. Cartap hydrochloride (Suntap 50%SP)
2. Phenthoate (Elsan 50%EC)
3. Imidacloprid (Matador 35%EC)

Trees in 2006 season were total coverage sprayed using ground motor sprayer (600 litre capacity). Amixture of the mineral

oil (Chemi oil) at rate of 0.25% was tank mixed with Dimectin 1.8% EC, Mectin 1.8% EC, Match 5% EC, Tracer 24% SC and Actara 25% WG at concentrations of 0.025, 0.025, 0.02, 0.008 and 0.007%, respectively. In 2007 season, trees were treated with suntap 50% SP, Matador 35% EC and Elsan 50% EC at rates of 0.1, 0.005 and 0.045%, respectively. Same spraying machine and same technique applied in 2006 season was used. Area of each treatment and/or untreated control was one feddan (about 160 trees, i.e. 10 rows x 16 trees). Five replicates from tender twigs 15-20 cm in length (each contains 10 twigs) were randomly collected every week from each treatment as well as untreated control. Five leaves from each twig (i.e. 250 leaves from each treatment) were inspected using a stereoscopic microscope. Number of serpentine mines, alive and dead individuals (larvae and pupae) of *P. citrella* were counted and recorded. In addition number of parasitized individuals with both *Baryscapus* sp. and *Cirrospilus* spp. were counted. Reduction percent for either number of mines or living individuals were calculated according to Henderson and Tilton (1955). Statistical analysis was conducted using F. test (Snedecor and Cochran, 1981).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

1. First Season

Reduction in mines

Data presented in Table (1) indicate that all tested insecticides mixed with Chemi oil in 2006 season were effective in reducing mean number of serpentine mines in navel orange leaves one week after application. Percentages of reduction were 97.06, 96.66, 98.35, 99.01 and 96.93% for Dimectin 1.8% EC, Mectin 1.8% EC, Match 5% EC, Tracer 24% SC and Actara 25% WG, respectively. However, efficiency of tested insecticides began to vary starting from the 2nd up the 5th week post treatment. Average reduction percent values after 5 weeks from application indicate that Mectin 1.8% EC was the most effective among all tested products. Insecticides could be arranged descendingly

according to their efficacy as follows: Mectin 1.8% EC (81.63%) > Dimectin 1.8% EC (78.97%) > Match 5% EC (73.95%) > Actara 25% WG (64.73%) > Tracer 24%SC (61.94%) However, statistical analysis for average number of mines/leaf after 5 weeks of application show clearly that there were high significant differences between all tested insecticides and untreated control. Data also show that Mectin 1.8%EC and Dimectin 1.8% EC protected most new flushes from reinfestation with *P. citrella* throughout four successive weeks after application. Percent reduction in mean number of mines/leaf in new flushes for four weeks post treatment were 97.06, 96.57, 93.95 and 75.51% for Dimectin 1.8%EC, while they were 96.66, 91.88, 88.57 and 84.43% for Mectin 1.8%EC. Match 5%EC

was effective in keeping new flushes from reinfestation until the 3rd week after application. Afterward, it declined at the 4th and 5th week post application. Tracer 24%SC and Actara 25%WG were the least effective tested products. Their effect declined drastically after the 3rd week of application

These results are in agreement with those obtained by Moraes *et al.* (1999) who found that abamectin + mineral oil (25me+ 250ml) was the most effective treatment for controlling *P. citrella* in Brazil 7 and 14 days after application. In China, Lei BangHai and Wu QiNeng (2000) applied abamectin-petroleum (24.5%) at dilutions 1:500, 1:1000, 1:1500, 1:2000 to 8 years-old citrus trees heavily infested with *P. citrella*. They stated that 7 days after treatment with abamectin-petroleum, percent reduction of infestation were 95.8, 91.6, 89.2 and 83.2%, respectively. Villanueva-Jimenez *et al.* (2000) compared potentially selective and integrated pest management (IPM) compatible pesticides against *P. citrella* in Florida. They reported that petroleum oil at 3%, azadirachtin at 1x the LRFR (Least Recommended Field Rate) + 4% oil and diflubenzuron at 1x the LRFR + 4% oil were shown to be IPM-compatible pesticides, where they had fewer mines per leaf.

Reduction in alive individuals

Data illustrated in Table (2) represent the efficacy of tested pesticides mixed with Chemi oil on mean number of alive individuals (larvae & pupae) of *P. citrella* during 2006 season. All tested insecticides were highly effective within the first two weeks after application, except for Actara 25%WG which was the least effective product at end of the 2nd week (88.73%). However, no significant difference in mean number of alive individuals/leaf was recorded when compared with other insecticides. Starting from the 3rd week after application, significant differences in efficacy among tested insecticides were recorded. Dimectin 1.8%EC and Mectin 1.8% EC were significantly more effective than the other three tested insecticides. Reduction percentages in mean number of alive individuals/leaf three weeks post treatment were 99.83 and 90.68 for Dimectin and Mectin,

while they were 78.45, 75.74 and 76.76% for Match, Tracer and Actara, respectively. Four weeks after application reduction percentages in mean number of alive individuals/leaf started to decline for all tested products. However, Dimectin and Mectin were still significantly more effective than other insecticides. Same trend extended the fifth week after application. In addition, there were no significant differences between untreated control and the three insecticides Match, Tracer and Actara. Average reduction percentages in mean number of alive individuals/leaf after 5 weeks of treatment, were, 85.30, 82.94, 68.89, 66.65 and 69.11 for Dimectin, Mectin, Match, Tracer and Actara, respectively. It could be concluded that mixing abamectin when tested through the two different formulations (Dimectin and Mectin 1.8%EC) with Chemi oil is considered the most effective in reducing mean number of alive individuals of *P. citrella*. Efficacy of these two mixtures extended to the fourth week after application and succeeded to protect new flushes of navel orange leaves during 2006 summer season from infestation for such period of time. These results are in harmony with those obtained by Raja *et al.* (1998b) who stated that mixtures of mineral oil with acetamiprid, fipronil or abamectin had the lowest numbers of CLM larvae up to 7 days after application. At 15 days after application with a mixture of either acetamiprid or abamectin with mineral oil, less number of pupae were noticed. Tested insecticides were ineffective in reducing CLM population density 22 days after application.

Mortality and parasitism percentages

Table (3) show the efficiency of certain insecticides mixed with Chemi oil on mortality percentages of larvae and pupae of *P. citrella* as well as percent of parasitism with the two parasites *Baryscapus* sp. and *Cirrospilus* spp. at Sharkia Governorate during 2006 summer season. Data clearly indicate that Dimectin 1.8%EC was the most effective among tested insecticide, one week after application. Mortality percentages of both larvae and pupae one week post treatment were 100, 62.50, 81.25, 85.71 and 84.00 for Dimectin 1.8%EC, Mectin 1.8%EC, Match 5%EC, Tracer 24%SC and Actara

25%WG, respectively. While, it was 6.63% in untreated control. Efficacy of Dimectin 1.8% EC represented by values of mortality percentages of larvae and pupae extended up to the third week after application, while it decreased drastically in rest of pesticides starting from the second week post treatment. Dimectin 1.8%EC induced 100, 95.63 and 97.22% mortality at the first 3 weeks after application, respectively. Mean average in mortality percentages after five weeks from treatment were 71.28, 44.72, 34.19, 45.16, and 38.28 for dimectin 1.8% EC, Mectin 1.8% EC, Match 5% EC, Tracer 24%SC and Actara 25% WC, respectively. While it was 12.33 % in untreated control. Rezk *et al.* (1996) found that Vertemic (abamectin) + mineral oil was the most effective combination against *P. citrella* followed by mixture of methomyl + dimethoate when mortality was recorded 2,7 and 21 days after treatment. Mortality percent in untreated control decreased one week after application of insecticides. It was 17.91 and 6.63% before and after one week post application of insecticides, respectively. Afterward, mortality percentage in untreated control started to increase by lapse of time. This could be attributed to the adverse effect of sprayed insecticides in general on population density of parasites in whole area. Population density of parasites began to recover 2 weeks after application represented in increment of percent mortality in untreated control. Dimectin 1.8% EC which induced the highest mortality percentages on larvae and pupae had no adverse effect on the larval endoparasite *Baryscapus* sp. or prepupal ectoparasite *Cirrospilus* spp. No significant difference in average percent of parasitism in inspected navel orange leaves at the area treated with Dimectin 1.8% EC + Chemi oil and untreated control area was recorded. Mean average percent of parasitism five weeks after application was 1.30% in area treated with Dimectin 1.8%EC, while it was 1.07% in untreated control area.

2. Second Season

Reduction in infestation

Data in Table (4) represent efficacy of three insecticides (belonging to three different chemical groups) on mean number of

serpentine mines induced by *P. citrella* on new flushes of navel orange trees in 2007 summer season. All tested products showed high significant effect on mean number of mines through 6 weeks after application. Among the tested products, Elsan 50%EC was the most effective and persistent, while Matador 35%EC was the least effective. No significant differences in mean number of mines/leaf or average of mines/leaf through the first five weeks after application were recorded between Suntap 50%SP and Elsan 50%EC. However, at the sixth week after application efficiency of Elsan 50%EC was significantly higher than that of Suntap 50% SP. Average mean reduction in number of mines/leaf after six weeks of applications were 91.6, 79.0 and 73.0% for Elsan 50%EC, Suntap 50% SP and Matador 35%EC, respectively. Bei XuFang *et al.* (1999) reported that imidacloprid 10% when used at dilutions of 1:1000, 1:2000, 1:3000 and 1:4000 gave 98.9, 95.31, 93.5 and 92.6% control after 7 days of application against *P. citrella*, respectively, while Marshal e.c. (carbosulfan) at 20% induced 94.1% control. Mosallam *et al.* (2008) found that acetamiprid was more effective than Dimethoate or Kz oil. It reduced percent of infestation with *P. citrella* by 60.26 and 78.33% after 1st and 2nd applications, respectively.

Reduction in living individuals

Effect of three tested insecticides during 2007 summer season on mean number of alive individuals/leaf of *P. citrella* are presented in Table (5). Data clearly indicate that Elsan 50%EC was the most effective insecticide followed by Suntap 50% SP and Matador 35%EC. Average mean reduction percent in number of mines/leaf 6 weeks after applications were 94.80, 80.30 and 80.13% for Elsan 50%EC, Suntap 50%SP and Matador 35%EC, respectively. However, average mean number of mines/leaf in Elsan 50%EC was significantly less than in Matador 35%EC, which showed no significant difference when compared with Suntap 50%SP. In Tunisia Boulahia *et al.* (1996) reported that confidor (imidacloprid), Evisect (thiocyclon) and the mineral oil Oleosect significantly decreased *P. citrella* population and confidor was the best

among the three tested insecticides. In Brazil Raja *et al.* (1998a) stated that 6 days post treatment, tebuferozide, cartap, fipronil, carbonyl and hexythiazox were the most effective against CLM resulting over 80% reduction in larval population in comparison with untreated control. In Egypt, Mosallam *et al.* (2008) found that acetamiprid was more effective against *P. citrella* than Dimethoate and Kz oil.

Mortality and parasitism percentages

Table (6) illustrate the effect of the three tested insecticides on percent mortality of larvae and pupae of *P. citrella* (on navel orange leaves) as well as percent of parasitism by the two parasites *Baryscapus* sp. and *Cirrospilus* spp. when applied during 2007 summer season. Effect of Suntap 50%SP was low at the first two weeks after application, (32.85 & 45.98%), respectively. Efficiency of this product increased at the 3rd and 4th week after treatment reaching 97.22 & 96.55%, then declined to 13.33 and 0.0% at 5th and 6th week, respectively Matador 35%EC showed higher efficacy than Suntap 50%SP one week after application (62.50%), then declined gradually in progressive weeks after application (47.33, 32.35, 37.55, 21.47 and 25.97%) for 2nd, 3rd, 4th, 5th and 6th, respectively. Elsan 50% EC showed high and potent efficacy with in 4 weeks after application. Percent mortality recorded were 98.36, 93.44, 79.66 and 82.35 for week 1,2,3 and 4, respectively. Afterward its efficacy declined drastically at 5th week (34.29%) reaching 0.0% at the 6th week post application. Data clearly show that Elsan 50%EC and Suntap 50%SP (irrespective to its low effect within the first two weeks post application) gave promising results extended to 4 weeks after treatment. Tested insecticides could be arranged according to their efficiency as represented in average mortality percent after 6 weeks of treatment on the following order: Elsan 50%EC (64.68%), Suntap 50% SP (47.66%) and Matador 35%EC (37.86%).

Data clearly show that the three tested insecticides had different influences on the two parasites *Baryscapus* sp. and *Cirrospilus* spp. Matador 35%EC (which had the least effect on larvae and pupae of *P. citrella*) showed the lowest adverse effect on percent of parasitism. Percentages of parasitism were significantly higher than untreated control throughout the six weeks of this study except for 2nd week after application. As shown earlier, Suntap 50% SP (which induced low effect on *P. citrella* of the first two weeks post application) had also less detrimental effect against the two parasites (parasitism percentages were 0.97 & 1.96, respectively). At the 3rd and 4th weeks, percentages of parasitism reached 0.0%, while at the same time, percentages of mortality against *P. citrella* were 97.22 and 96.55% respectively. This could be attributed to latent toxic effect of this product on either *P. citrella* or parasites. On the contrary, Elsan 50%EC induced severe adverse effect on percent of parasitism within the first two weeks after applications (0.0%), as well as it gave the highest effect on *P. citrella* during this period of time. By lapse of time percent of parasitism increased and efficacy of the product on *P. citrella* started to decrease. This could be attributed to decrement in residues of that product by lapse of time. In General, the three tested insecticides could be arranged descendingly according to their adverse effect on percent of parasitism (represented in values of mean percent of parasitism) for the two parasites *Baryscapus* sp. and *Cirrospilus* spp. as follows: Suntap 50%SP (0.50), Elsan 50%EC (2.66) and Matador 35%EC (8.37). Raja *et al.* (1998a) studied the effect of 14 different insecticides on CLM. they stated that level of parasitism by *Galeopsomya* sp. (Eulophidae) ranged between 4.1-34.7%. Mosallam *et al.* (2008) found that percent of parasitism for acetamiprid, Dimethoate and KZ oil ranged between 2.01-4.18 and 2.82-6.72 after 1st and 2nd treatments, respectively.

REFERENCES

- Ayoub, M.S. (1960): *Phyllocnistis citrella* Stn. A main citrus pest in Saudi Arabia. Bull. Soc. Ent. Egypte, 44: 387-391.
- Badawy, A. (1967): The morphology and biology of *Phyllocnistis citrella* Stain. A citrus leaf-miner in the Sudan. Bull. Soc. Ent. Egypte, 51: 95-103.
- Bei XuFang, Jiang LiYing, Chi XuLiang and He QingWei (1999): Control of citrus leaf miner with imidacloprid WP. Plant Protection, 25 (4): 52-53.
- Boulahia, S.K., Jerraya, A. and Zaidi, H. (1996): Chemical treatment trials against the citrus leaf miner, *Phyllocnistis citrella*. Fruits (Paris), 51 (4): 223-228.
- Gonzalez, J.L. and Stein, B. (1996): The citrus leaf miner. Present situation in the Mediterranean basin, Australia, South Africa and Florida. Avance Agroindustrial, 16 (65): 42-44.
- Henderson, C.F. and Tilton, E.W. (1955): Tests with acaricides against the brown wheat mite. J. Econ. Entomol., 48: 157-161.
- Happner, J.B. (1995): Citrus leafminer (Lepidoptera: Gracillariidae) on fruit in Florida. Florida Entomologist, 78 (1): 183-186.
- Kfoury, L. and El-Amil, R. (1998): Pest in Lebanese citrus orchards in 1997. Phytoma, No. 508: 38-39.
- Korashy, M.A. (1998): Evaluation of certain insecticides against citrus leaf miner. Egypt. J. Appl. Sci., 13 (6): 282-287.
- Lei Bang Hai and Wu QiNeng (2000): Trials on the effects of abamectin - petroleum in cotrolling citrus leafminer. Plant Protection, 26 (6): 37-38.
- Moraes, L.A.H. De; De Souza, E.L.S.; Becker, R.F.P. and Braun, J. (1999): Chemical control of citrus leaf miner *Phyllocnistis citrella* (Stain.) 1856. Pesquisa Agropecuaria Gaucha, 5 (1): 19-22.
- Mosallam, A.M.Z.; Anas A. Ahmed; Aida M. El-Hakim and Salwa K. Hanna (2008): Efficiency of acetamiprid against citrus leaf miner, *Phyllocnistis citrella* (Stain.) (Lepidoptera, Phyllocnistidae). Zagazig J. Agric. Res., 35 (1): 95-112.
- Mustafa, T.M. and Ateyyat, M.A. (1998): Chemical control of citrus leafminer *Phyllocnistis citrella* (Stain.) (Lepidoptera: Gracillariidae) on lemon in Jordan valley. Arab J. Plant Protection, 16 (2): 86-89.
- Nucifora, A. (1996): Control of *Phyllocnistis citrella* in Italy. Informatore Agrario, 52 (47): 57-77.
- Pizza, M. and Moleas, T. (2002): Controlling *Phyllocnistis citrella* on bitter orange in nurseries. Informatore Agrario, 58 (28):65-68.
- Raja, A.; Ceravolo, L.C.; Sato, M.E.; Francisco De Souza Filho, M.; Montes, S.M.N.M. and Rossi, A.C. (1998a): Effect of insecticides on *Phyllocnistis citrella* (Stain.) (Lep.: Gracillariidae) on sweet orange "Pera" (*Citrus sinensis* L. Osbeck). Revista de Agricultura (Piracicaba), 73 (2): 143-154.
- Raja, A.; Ceravolo, L.C.; De Souza Filho, M.F.; Montes, S.M.N.M.; Rossi, A.C. and Sato, M.E. (1998b): Insecticides against *Phyllocnistis citrella* (Stain.) (Lep.: Gracillariidae) in citrus (*Citrus sinensis* L. Osbeck). Arquivos do instituto Biologico (Sao Paulo), 65 (1): 35-42.
- Rezk, H.A.; Gadelhak, G.G. and Shawir, M.S. (1996): Field evaluation of certain insecticides on the citrus leafminer *Phyllocnistis citrella* (Stain.) Lepidoptera: Gracillariidae: Phyllocnistinae) in North Tahrir area. Alex. J. Agric. Res., 41 (1): 151-161.
- Salas, H. and Goane, L. (2001): Monitoring of the principal pests of lemon in Tucuman. Avance Agroindustrial, 22 (3): 27-30.
- Salas, H.; Figueroa, D. and Willink, E. (1997): First trials on chemical control of the citrus leaf miner (*Phyllocnistis citrella* Stain.) in Tucuman. Avance Agroindustrial, 17 (69): 22-24.
- Snedecor, G.W. and Cochran, W.G. (1981): Statistical methods. 7th ed. Iowa State Univ. Press, USA, 305pp.
- Vargas, O.H.; Bobadilla, D.; Jimenez, R.M. and Vargas, C.H. (1999): A preliminary trial about larval susceptibility of *Phyllocnistis citrella* (Stain.) (Lepidoptera: Gracillariidae) to insecticides sprayed on the foliage. IDESA, 16: 23-27.
- Villanueva-Jimenez, J.A.; Hoy, M.A. and Davies, F.S. (2000): Field evaluation of integrated pest management-compatible pesticides for the citrus leafminer *Phyllocnistis citrella* (Lepidoptera: Gracillariidae) and its parasitoid *Ageniaspis citricola* (Hymenoptera: Encyrtidae) J. Econ. Entomol., 93 (2): 357-367.

- Yamamoto, P.T.; Roberto, S.R. and Pria, W.D.Jr. (2000): Systemic insecticides applied on citrus tree trunk to control *Oncometopia facialis*, *Phyllocnistis citrella* and *Toxoptera citricide*. Scientia Agricola, 57 (3): 415-420.
- Zhang QuanBing; Lei HuiDe; Lin BangMao; Ran Chun; Li HongYun; Tian WenHua and Qian KeMing (2001): Experimental control of citrus leaf miner. South China Fruits, 30 (4): 17.

تجارب حقلية لمكافحة حشرة صانعة أنفاق أوراق الموالج في مصر

طلال صلاح الدين العباسي، أحمد محمود زكي مسلم، أناس عبد العزيز أحمد
معهد بحوث وقاية النباتات - الدقى - الجيزة

أجريت تجارب حقلية لمكافحة حشرة صانعة أنفاق أوراق الموالج على النموات الصيفية لأشجار البرتقال أبو سرة باستخدام مبيدات متعددة خلال موسمين متتاليين (٢٠٠٦، ٢٠٠٧) بمحافظة الشرقية. ولقد أثبتت النتائج أن مركب أبامكتين عندما استخدم بمستحضرين مختلفين (مكتين ١,٨% مستحلب مركز، ديمكتين ١,٨% مستحلب مركز) وعند خلطهما مع الزيت المعدني كيمي أويل أنهما الأكثر فعالية من بين جميع المبيدات المستخدمة خلال موسم ٢٠٠٦. وقد امتدت فعالية مركب ديمكتين ١,٨% مستحلب مركز + زيت كيمي أويل إلى ٤ أسابيع بعد المعاملة بالإضافة إلى ذلك لم يحدث هذا المركب أى تأثير ضار على النسبة المئوية للتطفل بالنوعين *Cirrospilus* spp., *Baryscapus* sp. بمقارنته بباقي المبيدات. كما أظهرت نتائج التجارب التي أجريت في موسم ٢٠٠٧ أن المركب الفوسفورى العضوى السان ٥٠% مستحلب مركز كان الأكثر فاعلية من بين الثلاث مبيدات التي تم اختبارها. كما أن هذا المركب لم يظهر أى تأثير معاكس على النسبة المئوية للتطفل مع نهاية التجربة. أما مركب ماتادور ٣٥% مستحلب مركز (وهو يتبع مجموعة النيونيكوتينويد) فقد كان المركب الأقل فاعلية. ومع ذلك فقد كانت النسبة المئوية للتطفل مرتفعة معنويًا عنها في غير المعامل. ولقد أعطى مركب صن تاب ٥٠% مسحوق قابل للذوبان (وهو يتبع مجموعة الثيوكراميت) نتائج مشجعه حتى الأسبوع الرابع بعد المعاملة. ومع ذلك فلقد أدى لحدوث تأثيرا معاكسا بدرجة معنوية على النسبة المئوية للتطفل. لذا يمكن أن نوصى باستخدام أى من المركبين ديمكتين ١,٨% مستحلب مركز (مادته الفعالة أبا مكتين) مخلوطًا مع الزيت المعدني كيمي أويل أو مركب السان ٥٠% مستحلب مركز (مادته الفعالة Phenthoate) منفردًا في مكافحة صانعة أنفاق الموالج على نموات الصيف لتوفير حماية لا تقل عن أربعة أسابيع وبأقل ضرر على النسبة المئوية للتطفل.