



Tanta University  
Faculty of Science  
Zoology of Department

## Compatibility between natural enemies and essential oils for the control of stored legume pests.

Thesis to faculty of science, Tanta University for the degree of  
Doctor of Philosophy in Zoology (Insects)

By  
**Walaa Masoud Abd El-wanies Alkot**  
(B.Sc., Al Azhar University, 2005)  
(M.sc., Tanta University, 2015)

### Supervisors

|   |  |
|---|--|
| <i>Prof. Dr.</i><br><b>Amal Ibrahim Seif</b><br>Prof. of Entomol., Zoology Dept.,<br>Fac. of Sci., Tanta Univ | <i>Prof. Dr.</i><br><b>El-Saied Ahmed Naiem</b><br>Prof. of Entomol., Zoology Dept.,<br>Fac. of Sci., Tanta Univ |
| <i>Dr.</i><br><b>Yahya Ahmed El-Nagar</b><br>Lecturer, Zoology Dept.,<br>Fac. of Sci., Tanta Univ.            | <i>Prof. Dr.</i><br><b>Mohsen Attia Abo Tayesh</b><br>Chief Researcher, Plant Prot.<br>Res. Inst., ARC, Egypt    |

2020

## **Compatibility between natural enemies and essential oils for the control of stored legume pests.**

### **Abstract**

The objectives of the present study were to determine the fumigant, repellent and contact effects of basil, *Ocimum basilicum*, fenugreek, *Trigonella foenum-graecum* and garlic, *Allium sativum* as essential oils (EOs) against *Callosobruchus maculatus* and *Tyrophagus putrescentiae*. In view of the importance of using the natural enemies as a biological control in IPM programs, the impact of EOs on the Hymenoptera parasitoid, *Anisopteromalus calandrae* and the predator mite, *Cheyletus malaccensis* were evaluated. Also, the effect of EOs on the biology of tested arthropods in terms of reproductive potential and adult emergence. Finally, the biochemical response of *C. maculatus* to sublethal concentrations of EOs was determined. Data obtained demonstrated that *A. sativum*, *O. basilicum* and *T. foenum-graecum* EOs had fumigant toxicity on the stored grain pests *C. maculatus* and *T. putrescentiae*, and susceptibility of *T. putrescentiae* was the highest. Fumigant toxicity effect of EOs was also higher to the predator mite *C. malaccensis*. All EOs possesses repellency activity against *C. maculatus*, *T. putrescentiae* and the predator mite, *C. malaccensis*. The repellency of all EOs increased with increasing concentration. Results from lethal contact toxicity showed that *O. basilicum* was least effect after three days post exposure against *C. maculatus*, *T. putrescentiae* and *C. malaccensis* with LC<sub>50</sub> values of 19792.8, 9520.8 and 32334.5 ppm, respectively. *A. sativum* oil induced the highest effect on *T. putrescentiae* and *C. malaccensis* with LC<sub>50</sub> values of 4676.0 and 12453.1 ppm after three days, respectively. Mortality of *C. maculatus* on cowpea seeds treated with sub lethal concentrations equivalent to 1/5 LC<sub>50</sub> of *A. sativum* was higher than *O. basilicum* and *T. foenum-graecum* EO five days post exposure. A similar trend was observed for *T. putrescentiae*. All EOs at sublethal concentrations were highly detrimental to both *A. calandrae* and *C. malaccensis*. The effect of sublethal concentrations of EOs on *A. calandrae* was also similar in case of the predator mite, *C. malaccensis*. The protein and lipid level of *A. sativum* EO exposed adults was not significantly different from those of their controls. Based on lethal and sublethal direct exposure study, it could be concluded that all EOs evaluated were generally highly detrimental and non selective to both *A. calandrae*

and *C. malaccensis* and would be incompatible with biological control of *C. maculatus* and *T. putrescentiae*.

## CONTENTS

|  |    |
|--|----|
| 1. INTRODUCTION .....  | 1  |
| 2. LITERATURE REVIEW .....   | 6  |
| 2. 1. The pulse beetle, <i>Callosobruchus maculatus</i> .....  | 6  |
| 2.2. The storage mite, <i>Tyrophagus putrescentiae</i> .....   | 7  |
| 2.3. The solitary ectoparasitoid <i>Anisopteromalus calandrae</i> .....  | 7  |
| 2.4. The predatory mite, <i>Cheyletus malaccensis</i> .....  | 8  |
| 2. 5. Fumigant toxicity of essential oils .....  | 8  |
| 2.6. Repellent activity of essential oils .....  | 11 |
| 2.7. Contact toxicity of essential oils .....  | 14 |
| 2.8. Effect of essential oils on stored grain mites .....  | 16 |
| 2.9. Pesticide effect on natural enemies of insect and mite pests of<br>stored grain.....  | 18 |
| 2.10. Sublethal effects of pesticides on natural enemies... .....  | 20 |
| 2.11. Effect of essential oils on the biology of insects.....  | 22 |
| 2.12. Effect of essential oils on energy reserves of <i>Callosobruchus</i><br><i>maculatus</i> .....   | 25 |
| 3. MATERIALS AND METHODS .....   | 27 |
| 3.1. Mass rearing and maintenance of the cowpea beetle,<br><i>Callosobruchus maculatus</i> .. ....   | 27 |
| 3.2. Rearing of the parasitoid, <i>Anisopteromalus calandrae</i> .....   | 27 |
| 3.3. Rearing of the stored product mite, <i>Tyrophagus putrescentiae</i>   | 28 |
| 3.4. Rearing of the predatory mite, <i>Cheyletus malaccensis</i> .....   | 28 |
| 3.5. Essential oils .....  | 28 |
| 3.6. Fumigant toxicity bioassay .....  | 28 |
| 3.7. Repellent activity assay.....   | 29 |
| 3. 8. Contact toxicity bioassay .....  | 30 |
| 3.9. Sub-lethal concentration toxicity of essential oils on<br><i>Callosobruchus maculates</i> , <i>Tyrophagus putrescentiae</i> ,<br><i>Cheyletus malaccensis</i> and <i>Anisopteromalus calandrae</i> .....  | 31 |
| 3.10. Effect of lethal and sub-lethal concentrations of essential<br>oils on the biology of <i>Callosobruchus maculates</i> , <i>Tyrophagus</i><br><i>putrescentiae</i> and <i>Cheyletus malaccensis</i> ..... | 31 |
| 3.11. Total effect of essential oils on the <i>Cheyletus malaccensis</i> ...   | 32 |

|  |    |
|--|----|
| 3.12. Biochemical analysis.....  | 33 |
| 3.12.1. Assessment of total protein.....   | 33 |
| 3.12.2. Assessment of total lipids.....  | 33 |
| 3.12.3. Assessment of carbohydrate level.....  | 34 |
| 3.12.4. Assessment of glycogen level.....  | 34 |
| 3.10. Statical analysis.....   | 35 |
| 4. RESULTS.....  | 36 |
| 4. 1. Fumigant toxicity of essential oils .....  | 36 |
| 4.1.1. Fumigant toxicity of essential oils to <i>Callosobruchus maculatus</i> adults .....           | 36 |
| 4.1.2. Fumigant toxicity of essential oils to the mite, <i>Tyrophagus putrescentiae</i> adults ..... | 39 |
| 4.1.3. Fumigant toxicity of essential oils to the predator mite, <i>Cheyletus malaccensis</i> .....  | 42 |
| 4.2. Repellency activity of essential oils.....  | 45 |
| 4.2.1. Repellency activity of essential oils to <i>Callosobruchus maculatus</i> adults .....         | 45 |
| 4.2.1.1. Repellency of fenugreek, <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> .....                             | 45 |
| 4.2.1.2. Repellency of garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> .....   | 46 |
| 4.2.1.3. Repellency of basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> .....  | 47 |
| 4.2.2. Repellency activity of essential oils to the mite, <i>Tyrophagus putrescentiae</i> .....      | 49 |
| 4.2.2.1. Repellency of fenugreek, <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> .....                             | 49 |
| 4.2.2.2. Repellency of garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> .....   | 50 |
| 4.2.2.3. Repellency of basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> .....  | 51 |
| 4.2.3. Repellent activity of essential oils to the predator mite, <i>Cheyletus malaccensis</i> ..... | 52 |
| 4.2.3.1. Repellency of fenugreek, <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> .....                             | 52 |
| 4.2.3.2. Repellency of garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> .....   | 53 |
| 4.2.3.3. Repellency of basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> .....  | 54 |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| 4.3. Lethal and sublethal contact toxicity of essential oils.....   | 55         |
| 4.3.1. Contact toxicity of essential oils to <i>Callosobruchus maculatus</i> adults.....  | 56         |
| 4.3.2. Contact toxicity of essential oils to the mite, <i>Tyrophagus putrescentiae</i> adults .....   | 59         |
| 4.3.3. Contact toxicity of essential oils to the predator mite, <i>Cheyletus malaccensis</i> .....  | 61         |
| 4.3.4. Sub lethal concentration effects of essential oils to <i>Callosobruchus maculatus</i> .....  | 63         |
| 4.3.5. Sub lethal concentration effects of essential oils on the mite, <i>Tyrophagus putrescentiae</i> .....                                    | 64         |
| 4.3.6. Sub lethal concentration effects of essential oils on the parasitoid, <i>Anisopteremalus calandrae</i> .....                             | 65         |
| 4.3.7. Sub lethal concentration effects of essential oils on the predator mite, <i>Cheyletus malaccensis</i> .....                              | 66         |
| 4.3.8. Effects of essential oils on the biological activities of <i>Callosobruchus maculatus</i> .....  | 68         |
| 4.3.9. Effects of essential oils on the biological activities of the mite, <i>Tyrophagus putrescentia</i> .....                                 | 70         |
| 4.3.10. Effects of essential oils on the biological activities of the predator mite, <i>Cheyletus malaccensis</i> .....                         | 71         |
| 4.3.11. Sublethal concentration effects of essential oils on the biological activities of <i>Callosobruchus maculatus</i> .....                 | 73         |
| 4.3.12. Sublethal concentration effects of essential oils on the biological activities of <i>Tyrophagus putrescentiae</i> .....                 | 74         |
| 4.3.13. Sublethal concentration effects of essential oils on the biological activities of the predator mite, <i>Cheyletus malaccensis</i> ..... | 76         |
| 4.3.14. Biochemical response of <i>Callosobruchus maculatus</i> to lethal concentrations of essential oils.....                                 | 77         |
| <b>5. DISCUSSION.....</b>   | <b>79</b>  |
| <b>6. SUMMARY.....</b>  | <b>109</b> |

|                          |     |
|--------------------------|-----|
| 7. LITERATURE CITED..... | 114 |
|--------------------------|-----|

## **ARABIC SUMMARY**

## LIST OF TABLES

|  |    |
|--|----|
| Table 1. LC <sub>50</sub> values (ppm) of basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> , fenugreek , <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> essential oils to <i>Callosobruchus maculatus</i> adults in fumigant toxicity bioassay two, four and six days post exposure .....            | 37 |
| Table 2. LC <sub>50</sub> values (ppm) of basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> , fenugreek , <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> essential oils to <i>Tyrophagus putrescentiae</i> adults in fumigant toxicity bioassay two, four and six days post exposure .....            | 39 |
| Table 3. LC <sub>50</sub> values (ppm) of basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> , fenugreek , <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> essential oils to predator mite, <i>Cheyletus malaccensis</i> adults in fumigant toxicity bioassay two, four and six days post exposure..... | 42 |
| Table 4. Percent repellency (PR) and repellency Class of fenugreek, <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> at different concentrations and exposure periods to <i>Callosobruchus maculatus</i> adults using filter paper assay.....  | 46 |
| Table 5. Percent repellency (PR) and repellency Class of garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> essential oil at different concentrations and exposure periods to <i>Callosobruchus maculatus</i> adults using filter paper assay .....   | 47 |
| Table 6. Percent repellency (PR) and repellency Class of basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> essential oil at different concentrations and exposure periods to <i>Callosobruchus maculatus</i> adults using filter paper assay.....   | 48 |
| Table 7. Percent repellency (PR) and repellency Class of fenugreek, <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> essential oil at different concentrations and exposure periods to the mite, <i>Tyrophagus putrescentiae</i> adults using filter paper assay.....  | 49 |
| Table 8. Percent repellency (PR) and repellency Class of garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> essential oil at different concentrations and exposure periods to <i>Tyrophagus putrescentiae</i> adults using  |    |

|   |    |
|---|----|
| filter paper assay.....   | 50 |
| Table 9. Percent repellency (PR) and repellency Class of basil,<br><i>Ocimum basilicum</i> basil essential oil at different concentrations and exposure periods to <i>Tyrophagus putrescentiae</i> adults using filter paper assay.   | 51 |
| Table 10. Percent repellency (PR) and repellency Class of fenugreek,<br><i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> essential oil at different concentrations and exposure periods to the predator mite,<br><i>Cheyletus malaccensis</i> adults using filter paper assay .....                                       | 53 |
| Table 11. Percent repellency (PR) and repellency Class of garlic,<br><i>Allium sativum</i> essential oil at different concentrations and exposure periods to the predator mite, <i>Cheyletus malaccensis</i> adults using filter paper assay .....  | 54 |
| Table 12. Percent repellency (PR) and repellency Class of basil,<br><i>Ocimum basilicum</i> essential oil at different concentrations and exposure periods to the predator mite, <i>Cheyletus malaccensis</i> adults using filter paper assay .....   | 55 |
| Table 13. LC <sub>50</sub> values (ppm) of basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> , fenugreek ,<br><i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> to<br><i>Callosobruchus maculatus</i> adults in contact bioassay one, two and three days post exposure to treated cowpea seeds .....        | 56 |
| Table 14.LC <sub>50</sub> values (ppm) of basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> ,<br>fenugreek, <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> to <i>Tyrophagus putrescentiae</i> adults in contact bioassay one, two and three days post exposure to treated cowpea seeds .....             | 59 |
| Table 15. LC <sub>50</sub> values (ppm) of basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> , fenugreek,<br><i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> to predator mite, <i>Cheyletus malaccensis</i> adults in contact bioassay one, two and three days post exposure to treated cowpea seeds..... | 61 |
| Table 16. Toxicity classification according to the standards established  |    |

|  |    |
|--|----|
| by the International Organization for Biological Control (IOBC/WPRS) of basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> , fenugreek, <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> essential oils to the predator mite, <i>Cheyletus malaccensis</i> three days post exposure to different concentrations .....  | 63 |
| Table 17. Mean mortality ( $\pm$ ) of <i>Callosobruchus maculatus</i> on cowpea seeds treated with sublethal concentrations of basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> , fenugreek, <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> essential oils on at different time intervals.....   | 64 |
| Table 18. Mean mortality ( $\pm$ SE) of <i>Tyrophagus putrescentiae</i> on cowpea seeds treated with sublethal concentrations of basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> , fenugreek, <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> essential oils on at different time intervals.....   | 65 |
| Table 19. Mean mortality ( $\pm$ SE) of <i>Anisoptremalus calandrae</i> on cowpea seeds treated with sublethal concentrations of basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> , fenugreek, <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> essential oils on at different time intervals.....   | 66 |
| Table 20. Mean mortality ( $\pm$ SE) of the predator mite, <i>Cheyletus malaccensis</i> on cowpea seeds treated with sublethal concentrations of basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> , fenugreek, <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> essential oils on at different time intervals.....   | 67 |
| Table 21. Toxicity classification according to the standards established by the International Organization for Biological Control (IOBC/WPRS) of basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> , fenugreek, <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> essential oils to the predator mite, <i>Cheyletus malaccensis</i> three days post exposure to different concentrations ..... | 68 |
| Table 22. Mean number ( $\pm$ SE) of <i>Callosobruchus maculatus</i> eggs laid, hatched eggs, emerged adults and percent reduction of F <sub>1</sub> adults exposed to basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> , fenugreek, <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i>  |    |

|   |    |
|---|----|
| essential oils at different concentration admixed with cowpea grains .....  | 69 |
| Table 23. Mean number ( $\pm$ SE) of <i>Tyrophagus putrescentiae</i> eggs laid, hatch eggs, emerged adults and percent reduction of F <sub>1</sub> adults exposed to basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> , fenugreek, <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> essential oils admixed with cowpea seeds .....  | 70 |
| Table 24. Mean number ( $\pm$ SE) of the predator mite, <i>Cheyletus malaccensis</i> eggs laid, hatch eggs, emerged adults and percent reduction of F <sub>1</sub> adults exposed to basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> , fenugreek, <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> essential oils admixed with cowpea seeds.....                         | 72 |
| Table 25. Mean number ( $\pm$ SE) of eggs laid, hatched eggs, emerged adults and percent reduction of F <sub>1</sub> adults of <i>Callosobruchus maculatus</i> exposed to sublethal concentrations of basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> , fenugreek, <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> essential oils admixed with cowpea seeds .....       | 74 |
| Table 26. Mean number ( $\pm$ SE) of <i>Tyrophagus putrescentiae</i> eggs laid, hatched eggs, emerged adults and percent reduction of F <sub>1</sub> adults exposed to sub lethal concentration of basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> , fenugreek, <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> essential oil admixed with cowpea seeds .....           | 75 |
| Table 27. Mean number ( $\pm$ SE) of the predator mite, <i>Cheyletus malaccensis</i> eggs laid, egg hatchability, emerged adults and percent reduction of F <sub>1</sub> adults exposed to sub lethal concentration of basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> , fenugreek, <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> oils admixed with cowpea seeds..... | 77 |
| Table 28. Effect of sub-lethal concentrations of basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> , fenugreek, <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> on the levels of total protein, lipids, glycogen and carbohydrate of <i>Callosobruchus maculatus</i> adults.....  | 78 |

## LIST OF FIGURES

|   |    |
|---|----|
| Figure 1: Fumigant mortality of adult <i>Callosobruchus maculatus</i> exposed to basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> , fenugreek , <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> essential oils at different concentrations and exposure periods..... | 38 |
| Figure 2: Fumigant mortality of adult <i>Tyrophagus putrescentiae</i> exposed to basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> , fenugreek, <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> essential oils at different concentrations and exposure periods.....  | 41 |
| Figure 3: Fumigant mortality of adult <i>Cheyletus malaccensis</i> exposed to basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> , fenugreek, <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> essential oils at different concentrations and exposure periods.....     | 44 |
| Figure 4: Contact mortality of adult <i>Callosobruchus maculatus</i> exposed to basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> , fenugreek, <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> essential oils at different concentrations and exposure periods.....   | 58 |
| Figure 5: Contact mortality of adult <i>Tyrophagus putrescentiae</i> exposed to basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> , fenugreek, <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> essential oils at different concentrations and exposure periods.....   | 60 |
| Figure 6: Contact mortality of adult <i>Cheyletus malaccensis</i> exposed to basil, <i>Ocimum basilicum</i> , fenugreek, <i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i> and garlic, <i>Allium sativum</i> essential oils at different concentrations and exposure periods.....      | 62 |